

# Government Plan 2023-2026: Scrutiny Review

Children, Education and Home  
Affairs Scrutiny Panel

8<sup>th</sup> December 2022

S.R.21/2022



States of Jersey  
States Assembly



États de Jersey  
Assemblée des États



<b>1</b>	<b>CHAIR’S FOREWORD</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>2</b>	<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>3</b>	<b>FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	<b>5</b>
	Findings	5
	Recommendations	9
<b>4</b>	<b>INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>5</b>	<b>INCOME AND EXPENDITURE</b>	<b>14</b>
	Departmental Budgets	14
	Departmental Heads of Expenditure	15
	Covid-19 Response and Recovery Spending	19
<b>6</b>	<b>NEW PROGRAMMES IN THE GOVERNMENT PLAN 2023-26</b>	<b>21</b>
	Summary of Revenue Expenditure Growth (GP 2023-26)	21
	Detail on Additional Revenue Programmes	23
	Programmes within Children, Young People, Education and Skills	23
	I-CYPES-GP23-001: Education Reform – Inclusion Review	23
	I-CYPES-GP23-002: Children’s Social Care Reform	30
	I-CYPES-GP23-003: Demographics and Needs Assessments	34
	I-CYPES-GP23-004: Social Worker Recruitment and Retention	37
	I-CYPES-GP23-005: Jersey Premium – Virtual School	38
	I-CYPES-GP23-006: 100 Day Plan – School Meals	39
	Programmes within Justice and Home Affairs	42
	I-JHA-GP23-001: Parish Registrations	42
	I-JHA-GP23-002: Ambulance Service	44
	I-JHA-GP23-003: Fire and Rescue Service	48
	I-JHA-GP23-004: Combined Control Room	51
	I-JHA-GP23-005: Brexit – Increased Activity and Border Compliance	52
	I-JHA-GP23-006: Governance and Performance	54
	I-JHA-GP23-007: Jersey Care Commission – Regulation Management	55
	I-JHA-GP23-008: TETRA Extension	56
	Programmes within States of Jersey Police	58
	I-SoJP-GP23-001: Police Resourcing	58
	I-SoJP-GP23-002: Victim Support	59
	I-SoJP-GP23-003: Associated Costs of Domestic Abuse Law	60
	Programmes within Non-Ministerial Departments	62
	I-PROB-GP23-001: Probation Officer	62
<b>7</b>	<b>VALUE FOR MONEY SAVINGS</b>	<b>63</b>
	Children, Young People, Education and Skills	63
	Justice and Home Affairs	64
	States of Jersey Police	65

<b>8 MAJOR PROJECTS</b>	<b>66</b>
Ambulance, Fire and Rescue Headquarters	66
School Estates	68
<b>9 ESTATES</b>	<b>69</b>
Land Acquisition	69
New School and Educational Developments	70
Upgrades to CYPES Estates	72
Army and Sea Cadet Headquarters	75
Firearms Range	76
Dewberry House – Sexual Assault Referral Centre	78
Prison Improvement Works	79
<b>10 WITNESSES AND EVIDENCE GATHERED</b>	<b>82</b>
<b>APPENDIX 1</b>	<b>83</b>
Terms of Reference	83
Panel membership	83
<b>APPENDIX 2</b>	<b>84</b>
Overarching recommendations, as per S.R. 20/2022 presented by the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel on 7 <sup>th</sup> December 2022	84

# 1 Chair's Foreword

---

The Panel has thoroughly reviewed the Proposed Government Plan 2023 – 2026. We have worked hard to learn and understand all matters in Jersey to do with children, education and home affairs, through visits, meetings and public hearings

An overarching issue remains difficulties with recruitment and retention of essential staff. We welcome the Ministerial plans to address these matters.

I am very grateful to the Panel officers who have been of great assistance to us, as part of a new States Assembly. I also thank all stakeholders who have engaged with this process, and of course, the Members of the Panel.



**Deputy Catherine Curtis**  
**Chair,**  
**Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel**

## 2 Executive Summary

---

The Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel (the 'Panel') has undertaken a review of the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, which provides details about the budget of the newly proposed 'Government Programme'.

### **Income and Expenditure**

The Panel highlights that the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026 requests the States Assembly to approve the total amounts transferred from the Consolidated Fund to the Departmental Heads of Expenditure (HoE). The Panel found that whilst a breakdown of the HoE was provided in a service level analysis and also some detail about the additional revenue programmes in the Annex, there was no comprehensive list of all programmes and projects available for the Children, Young People, Education and Skills (CYPES) Department, the Justice and Home Affairs (JHA) Department, and the States of Jersey Police (SoJP). The Panel has referenced the overarching recommendation from the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel which proposes that detail about ongoing expenditure and business as usual projects should be included in future Government Plans.

The Government Plan also provides specific funding for Covid-19 Response and Recovery spending and £2.215 million has been made available to CYPES for their post Covid-19 requirements. The Panel learnt that the majority of this sum (£1.78 million) relates to staff costs with the remainder relating to enhanced cleaning and environmental protections. However, no funding has been assigned to CYPES for post Covid-19 requirements after 2023. The Panel has therefore made a recommendation that the Minister for Children and Education should ensure that suitable plans are in place for 2024 onwards, so that budgets within CYPES are not squeezed to accommodate for the post Covid-19 requirements. The Panel also suggested that the post Covid-19 response from CYPES examines the wider impacts of the pandemic on the education and development of children in Jersey.

### **New Programmes: Revenue Expenditure Growth**

The Panel has reviewed all of the proposed revenue expenditure growth programmes for CYPES, JHA and SoJP and has commented on these in further detail in section 6 of this report.

CYPES has proposed new revenue growth of £16.4 million allocated in 2023, with an additional £1.6 million in the 'reserves' for school meals. The Panel learnt that the school meals programme will supply 4,000 meals per day to primary schools, however, found that further detail on the delivery and timescale of the programme was still to be determined.

There is £6.1 million of additional funding proposed for CYPES in relation to the 'Education Reform – Inclusion Review' programme. The Panel heard that this funding will support children with needs that are currently not met by the education system. The programme will be overseen by a new Inclusion Delivery Board, and the Panel has asked for further details about that board to be made public. The Inclusion programme will support the recruitment of additional staff and establishment of new Additional Resource Centres (ARCs). The Panel has recommended that stakeholders and parents are specifically consulted about changes to the existing ARCs.

The Panel is also aware of the new Jersey Funding Formula for schools and has recommended that the transitory elements of the formula and data used for calculations are made public and, also, that the Minister for Children and Education consult with headteachers

about the suitability of the Jersey Funding Formula, with the results of that feedback being made public. Additional funding has also been identified for the day-to-day operations of schools in the 'Demographic and Needs Assessments' programme funding. Further review and analysis is required regarding the suitability of the new funding formula used for this.

The Panel learnt that there would be a process to comprehensively reform Children's Social Care in Jersey and funding has been proposed in the sum of £6.5 million for each year of the Government Plan. Whilst high level information about the programme has been identified, further detail is required.

The programme for 'Social Worker Recruitment and Retention' has been assigned £1.8 million in 2023 and this sum reduces annually through the rest of the Government Plan. It was explained that the reliance on agency staff would reduce. The Panel has noted that concerns about recruitment and retention have been previously voiced and has made some recommendations for the Minister for Children and Education to consider in relation to mandatory exit interviews for staff in CYPES and the payment of a Jersey supplement for all permanent social workers in Jersey.

The Department for Justice and Home Affairs has proposed new revenue growth of £2.8 million in the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026. Over £1 million of additional funding is proposed for the States of Jersey Ambulance Service in 2023 to increase levels of operational emergency staff and, also, support governance and safety standards. Increases to funding for the States of Jersey Fire and Rescue Service (SoJFRS) have also been proposed across the 4 year Government Plan. The SoJFRS will receive an additional £495,000 in 2023 and their funding allocation will rise each year over the term of the Government Plan to address the increased governance and safety requirements.

New revenue growth of just over £1 million is proposed for the States of Jersey Police (SoJP) in 2023. The increase will ensure that the SoJP can maintain the minimum staffing capacity of 215 police officers and also provide additional funding for victim support and the associated costs of the adoption of the Domestic Abuse (Jersey) Law 2022.

The Panel also sought details about the new revenue expenditure request from the Probation and After-Care Service about the funding requested for an additional Probation Officer, which is required as a result of the new requirements for post-custodial supervision work and, also, the Domestic Abuse (Jersey) Law.

### **Value for Money Savings**

The Panel found that the Value for Money Savings targets for the departments had not been allocated and have been provided to departments as targets for 2023. The Panel highlights the overarching recommendations identified by the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel (numbered 18, 19 and 20, see Appendix 2) in relation to the Value for Money Savings.

### **Major Projects**

The Panel reviewed the details available for the 'Ambulance, Fire and Rescue Headquarters' major project, which has been delayed due to a wider estates review. The Panel has noted concerns about the maintenance of the current States of Jersey Ambulance Service building as a result of the delay.

The Panel highlights that the budget previously approved under the School Estates major project has been reassigned to Grouped Heads of Expenditure and is advised that this will assist CYPES manage and prioritise the estates projects.

## **Estates**

The Panel has briefly referenced Amendment 21 to the Government Plan in relation to the HoE for land acquisition. The Amendment, if approved, will specify that this HoE will be used to acquire sites relating to the use of Gas Place as the location for a new primary school in St. Helier. The Panel has recommended that the cost of removing any contaminated soil be factored into the acquisition of the land by the Government of Jersey.

As referenced in relation to the 'School Estates' major projects, above, the 'New School and Educational Developments' HoE has been created to provide the department with flexibility over various development projects. The Panel suggested that further detail is required about the planned prioritisation of projects in this HoE to provide public transparency. The Panel has also suggested that the Minister for Children and Education should commit to providing specific space for school libraries and spaces for music teaching as part of any new school development or redesign project.

The Panel has also suggested that greater transparency is required with regards to projects within the 'Upgrades to CYPES Estates' HoE. It is intended that this will progress the development of projects such as school improvements, work at Greenfields and the development of a therapeutic children's home (and others). The Panel also learned that the location of the new headquarters for the Army and Sea Cadets has been identified and will be announced in early 2023.

The Panel was advised that a number of estates projects would be funded out of the Criminal Offences Confiscation Fund, namely the Firearms Range, Dewberry House, and Prison Improvement works. However, the Panel had queries about how the funding cashflow would work and has requested further clarity from the Minister for Home Affairs on this point.

## 3 Findings and Recommendations

---

### Findings



#### **FINDING 1**

At the time of this report, there is not a publicly available list of projects and programmes to be delivered under the heads of expenditure for the Departments of Children, Education, Young People and Skills, Justice and Home Affairs, and the States of Jersey Police, the available breakdown of spend in these departments is detailed in the Service Level Analysis of the Appendix.

#### **FINDING 2**



£2.215 million is available to the Department of Children, Education, Young People and Skills in 2023 for post Covid-19 requirements. £1.78 million has been budgeted for staff costs and the remainder on cleaning and environmental protections.

#### **FINDING 3**



No funding has been allocated for post Covid-19 costs after 2023. Additional funding (whether one off expenditure or recurring) will need to be put forward through the Government Plan process for 2024.

#### **FINDING 4**



The Government will invest £6.1 million in 2023 to better support schools with resources for the purposes of 'inclusion' for children with needs that are unmet by the current education system. The money will fund new staff roles and Additional Resource Centres in all mainstream primary and secondary schools. The funding is recurring and £6.1 million is proposed for each year of this Government Plan.

#### **FINDING 5**



The Education Reform Inclusion Review programme will be overseen by an Inclusion Delivery Board chaired by the Director General of Justice and Home Affairs. The board membership also includes an independent expert in the world of children with special educational needs.

#### **FINDING 6**



The Panel has been advised that there are increasing levels of need across a wide spectrum of both mental and physical requirements in children. There are also needs arising because of low levels of prior attainment. Pupil need is calculated using indicators of Pupil Need within the new Jersey Funding Formula for Schools.

#### **FINDING 7**



It is proposed that existing specialist Additional Resource Centres (ARCs) are to be repurposed in order to provide a wider range of support to students with additional needs. New ARCs will be developed in almost every primary and secondary school.

**FINDING 8**

There will be 117 staff recruited as part of the Inclusion programme. This will include new staff and also some existing staff put on new contracts. There are some concerns about skilled recruitment challenges in educational settings and therefore whether this number of staff is achievable in 2023.

**FINDING 9**

There will be a process to comprehensively reform Children's Social Care in Jersey. This is in response to statutory requirements from the Children and Young People's Law. Whilst the high-level priorities and workstreams have been identified, there is further clarity required on the underlying detail and measurable outcomes for the programme, which is projected to require £6.5 million per year between 2023 and 2026.

**FINDING 10**

Further review and analysis is required regarding the suitability of the new funding formula used for the 'Demographics and Needs Assessments' programme.

**FINDING 11**

Tutors at the Jersey Music Service (JMS) were offered permanent contracts of employment during 2022, however, that cost was not reflected in the budget for the JMS. The Panel is advised that the provision of this funding will support those roles from 2023 onwards.

**FINDING 12**

The Funding for Social Worker Recruitment and Retention is £1.8 million in 2023 and this sum reduces annually through the rest of the Government Plan.

**FINDING 13**

Approval of the School Meals programme will fund the supply of 4,000 meals per day to be provided in the Island's primary schools. Further detail is required on the final business case for the delivery of the programme and confirmation of timescales.

**FINDING 14**

Free school meals are currently provided to all primary school pupils from income support families, with other children able to get meals at a cost of £2.50 per meal. The Minister confirmed that there were no current plans to change the price for pay-per-users, however, there are calls for the School Meals programme to be extended, so that a free school meal is provided to all pupils, not just those in receipt of income support.

**FINDING 15**

Discussions about the transitional arrangements relating to line management, facilities and processes, for the Office of the Superintendent Registrar (OSIR) are ongoing, and the OSIR will continue to operate with the support of Customer and Local Services until 31st December 2022. The additional £207,000 of funding from 2023 onwards will support additional staff at the OSIR

for undertaking the registrations function. No funding has been allocated for software changes.

#### **FINDING 16**



The Government Plan 2023-2026 funding allocated to the States of Jersey Ambulance Service addresses staffing, equipment and governance concerns raised by the will make provision for 13 additional full time equivalent frontline staff.

#### **FINDING 17**



The States of Jersey Ambulance Service commenced a formal Demand and Capacity Review which is due to complete by the end of 2022.

#### **FINDING 18**



The funding allocated to the States of Jersey Fire and Rescue Service as part of the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026 will fund firefighter training and, also, an increase in the number of firefighters (at various levels and ranks), with a recruitment campaign to start in early 2023.

#### **FINDING 19**



Staff costs historically reduced the spending capacity of the non-staff allocation available to the States of Jersey Fire and Rescue Service.

#### **FINDING 20**



The funding allocated to the Combined Control Room will be used to fund staff training and implement a management structure that will be guided by a new Service Level Agreement.

#### **FINDING 21**



The timetable for the 'extend and replace strategy' of the TETRA Extension project is likely to continue through to 2029 and 2030.

#### **FINDING 22**



The States Assembly has agreed that the States of Jersey Police has an agreed establishment number of 215 police officers, however, due to previous efficiencies this target has not been met. The additional revenue funding of £500,000 per annum for each year of this Government Plan will support the employment of more police officers to bring the force up to the requirements.

#### **FINDING 23**



The additional revenue programme for 'Victim Support' will provide longer term investment funding into the services provided to victims of crime.

#### **FINDING 24**



The £688,000 of Value for Money Savings target for the Department of Children, Education, Young People and Skills has not been allocated.

**FINDING 25**

The £144,000 of Value for Money Savings target for the Department of Justice and Home Affairs has not been allocated.

**FINDING 26**

The £117,000 of Value for Money Savings target for the States of Jersey Police has not been allocated.

**FINDING 27**

The major project to develop a new joint Ambulance, Fire and Rescue headquarters has been delayed because of a wider estate review and the previous States Assembly decision to review the current Fire and Rescue headquarters site for a new town primary school.

**FINDING 28**

£31.35 million has been removed from the approved capital expenditure for 'Schools Estates'. The projects which had been approved have been moved into new Grouped Heads of Expenditure to help CYPES manage and prioritise the estates projects.

**FINDING 29**

Amendment 21 to the Proposed Government Plan, lodged by the Council of Ministers, highlights that the 'Land Acquisition' Head of Expenditure will be used to secure sites relating to the use of Gas Place for a new primary school.

**FINDING 30**

The 'New School and Educational Developments' Head of Expenditure has been created to give the Department of Children, Young People, Education and Skills flexibility over various development projects.

**FINDING 31**

The 'Upgrades to CYPES Estates' Head of Expenditure has been created to give the Department of Children, Young People, Education and Skills flexibility over various development projects.

**FINDING 32**

A potential location for the future Army and Sea Cadet headquarters has been identified and the project has been progressed with initial planning and design, involving consultation from cadet leaders. The location of the new Army and Sea Cadet Headquarters will be announced in early 2023.

**FINDING 33**

The new Firearms Range has received planning permission, however, at the time of the Panel's hearing only one bid had been received for the building and delivery of the project. In addition to providing the Police with a site to train and use long arm weapons, the new facility could be used by other Islanders.

**FINDING 34**

The Firearms Range will be solely funded out of the Criminal Offences Confiscation Fund.

**FINDING 35**

Clarification is required about the funding of the Dewberry House – Sexual Assault Referral Centre Estates project from the Criminal Offences Confiscation Fund for 2023.

**FINDING 36**

Prison Improvement is underway at H.M. Prison La Moye in various phases. Works will continue beyond 2023 and further funding will be required. Plans include using parts of the prison estate as a space for the wider community and workplace 'hub' for Government employees.

**FINDING 37**

Clarification is required about the funding of the Prison Improvement Works from the Criminal Offences Confiscation Fund for 2023.

## Recommendations

**RECOMMENDATION 1**

The Minister for Children and Education should ensure that suitable plans are made for related Covid-19 costs from 2024 onwards and that this should not squeeze departmental budgets. The Minister should also explore the wider impacts of Covid-19 on Jersey children's education and development to establish whether any further funding will be required to address this in future Government Plans.

**RECOMMENDATION 2**

Details of the membership and terms of reference of the Inclusion Delivery Board, including should be made public.

**RECOMMENDATION 3**

The Minister for Children and Education should consult with headteachers during 2023 about the suitability of the new Jersey Funding Formula for schools and the results of that feedback should be made public.

**RECOMMENDATION 4**

The Minister for Children and Education should ensure that parents and other stakeholders are specifically consulted on the proposed changes to existing specialist Additional Resource Centres.

**RECOMMENDATION 5**

The Minister for Children and Education should publicise the transitional aspects of the Jersey School Funding Formula and share further details about the data used for calculations.

**RECOMMENDATION 6**

The Department of Children, Education, Young People and Skills should require all employees and agency staff to undertake an exit interview at the time they leave the Department or cease working for the Government of Jersey. Staff should have to 'opt out' of the exit interview, rather than 'opt in' and any reasons for opting out should be formally recorded. Information recorded from the exit interview process should be used as a way to gather constructive feedback and identify possible changes for the future.

**RECOMMENDATION 7**

The Minister for Children and Education should work with the States Employment Board to create a Jersey supplement for all permanent social workers to bring a parity of pay with temporary agency staff.

**RECOMMENDATION 8**

The Minister for Children and Education should consider extending the free school meals programme to all children in mainstream States primary schools in order to remove any stigma attached to means tested meals.

**RECOMMENDATION 9**

The Council of Ministers should identify funding for the maintenance of the current States of Jersey Ambulance Service building, as plans and location for replacement Headquarters are yet to be determined.

**RECOMMENDATION 10**

The Minister for Children and Education should ensure that future Government Plans provide transparent breakdowns of planned estates projects within Grouped Heads of Expenditure.

**RECOMMENDATION 11**

The Council of Ministers should confirm the estimated costs for removing contaminated soil from the Gas Place site. This cost should be factored into the acquisition of any land required for the new town primary school.

**RECOMMENDATION 12**

The Minister for Children and Education should provide further detail and in the next Government Plan about the prioritisation of the projects in the 'New School and Educational Developments' Head of Expenditure, so that there is public transparency about any changes made by the department to priorities.

**RECOMMENDATION 13**

As part of any school development or redesign project, including those within the 'New School and Educational Developments' Head of Expenditure, the Minister for Children and Education should commit to providing specific space for school libraries and spaces for music teaching.

**RECOMMENDATION 14**

The Minister for Children and Education should provide further detail in the next Government Plan about the prioritisation of the projects in the 'Upgrades to CYPES Estates' Head of Expenditure, so that there is public transparency about any changes made by the department to priorities.

**RECOMMENDATION 15**

The Minister for Home Affairs should announce the site and publish the plans for the new Army and Sea Cadet Headquarters as soon as possible in 2023. With a view to long term recruitment, the Minister for Home Affairs and the Minister for Children and Education should explore ties with the cadet services to ensure that there are sufficient opportunities to connect cadets with the range of community service occupations and career opportunities.

**RECOMMENDATION 16**

The Minister for Home Affairs should clarify the cashflow from the Criminal Offences Confiscation Fund (£1.8 million) in 2023. This relates to the 2023 funding for the Firearms Range (£1.7 million), Dewberry House (£2.8 million) and the Prison Improvement works (£2.985 million).

**RECOMMENDATION 17**

The Minister for Home Affairs should ensure that Islanders and community groups, where appropriate, can use the new Firearms Range facility.

**RECOMMENDATION 18**

The Minister for Home Affairs should explore opportunities for adding solar panels to H.M. Prison La Moye as part of future improvement works at the site.

## 4 Introduction

---

Following the 2022 elections, the newly formed Council of Ministers has developed its Government Programme, which comprises of<sup>1</sup>:

- The Common Strategic Policy ([P.98/2022](#));
- Ministerial Plans ([R.139/2022](#));
- The Government Plan ([P.97/2022](#)); and
- Delivery Plans (to be presented to the States Assembly in early 2023).

The Common Strategic Policy priorities, as set out in P.98/2022 (as amended) and approved by the States Assembly on 23<sup>rd</sup> November 2022 are:

1. Housing and Cost of Living;
2. Economy and Skills;
3. Children and Families;
4. Ageing Population;
5. Health and Wellbeing;
6. Environment;
7. Community.

The Ministerial Plans ([R.139/2022](#)) were published on 12<sup>th</sup> October 2022 and set out each Minister's priorities for this electoral term and the Council of Ministers' proposed legislative programme for 2023.

- The Minister for Children and Education's priorities are detailed on pages 11–14 of [R.139/2022](#).
- The Minister for Home Affairs' priorities are detailed on pages 35–37 of [R.139/2022](#).

The purpose of the Government Plan is to set out '*the income and expenditure that will support the delivery of the Common Strategic Policy and Ministerial Plans in 2023*'<sup>2</sup>. The Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026 document was lodged on 4<sup>th</sup> October 2022.

The Annex to the Proposed Government Plan ([R.146/2022](#)) was presented on 20<sup>th</sup> October 2022. It contains supporting information and further detail about some of the additional revenue programmes proposed by the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026.

The Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel ('the Panel') has undertaken a review of the Government Plan 2023–2026 in as much detail as possible with the information provided by Government. The Government Plan document has not provided any information about existing revenue programmes and is focussed on the new programmes of work.

The initial focus of this report will be to focus on the income and expenditure detailed within the Government Plan for the Heads of Expenditure falling under the Panel's remit. The Panel has then examined the additional revenue programmes proposed by the Government Plan 2023–2026. The Report also examines the Value for Money Savings Programme and the major projects and estates projects to be pursued by the Government.

---

<sup>1</sup> <https://www.gov.je/government/planningperformance/governmentprogramme/Pages/index.aspx> (accessed 14/11/2022)

<sup>2</sup> Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026 ([P.97/2022](#)), Government of Jersey, p. 13

The Panel has not considered the 'Information Technology' projects for Justice and Home Affairs or the Probation Service as part of this review of the Proposed Government Plan (as per page 61 of the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026).

The Panel highlights that the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel has made some overarching recommendations in relation to the new Government Programme in its review of the Government Plan 2023-2026 ([S.R.20/2022](#)). The overarching recommendations are detailed in Appendix 2 of this document.

## 5 Income and Expenditure

---

### Departmental Budgets

The Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel scrutinises the work of two Ministers; the Minister for Children and Education and the Minister for Home Affairs. Therefore, the project policy work contained in the programmes and capital projects assigned to the Panel predominantly sit under:



**Minister for Children and Education, Deputy Inna Gardiner**



**Minister for Home Affairs, Deputy Helen Miles**

The Panel has also considered new revenue expenditure growth for the Probation and After-Care Service.

## Departmental Heads of Expenditure

The Proposed Government Plan 2023–2026 ([P.97/2022](#)) asks the States Assembly to approve the amount to be appropriated from the Consolidated Fund for 2023, for each head of expenditure. The tables below provide a summary of the proposed “Heads of Expenditure” allocated to the Departments for 2023 and estimates produced for 2024 - 2026:

2022 Approved (£000)		2023 Allocation (£000)	2024 Estimate (£000)	2025 Estimate (£000)	2026 Estimate (£000)
167,478	Children Young People, Education and Skills	189,688	191,337	192,213	193,297
30,746	Justice and Home Affairs	35,170	36,287	36,341	36,309
25,205	States of Jersey Police	27,108	27,230	27,230	27,230

	Income (£000)	Expenditure Allocation (£000)	Head of Expenditure (£000)
Children, Young People, Education and Skills	21,220	210,908	189,688
Justice and Home Affairs	4,530	39,700	35,170
States of Jersey Police	234	27,342	27,108

A further breakdown of these figures was provided in the Annex to the Government Plan 2023-26. The 2023 figures are detailed below:<sup>5</sup>

Service Area	Near Cash Income (£000)	Near Cash Expenditure (£000)	Net Revenue Expenditure (£000)	Non Cash Depreciation (£000)	Total Net Revenue Expenditure (£000)	FTE
<b>Children’s Social Care &amp; Safeguarding</b>	6	31,490	31,484	-	31,484	344.0

<sup>3</sup> ‘Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026’, Table 14, p.43

<sup>4</sup> ‘Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026’, Summary Table 5i, p.93

<sup>5</sup> ‘Annex’ to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, *Government of Jersey*, p. 11, 23 and 26

<b>Education</b>	19,666	139,687	120,021	80	120,101	1,966.0
<b>Integrated Services and Commissioning</b>	120	10,906	10,786	-	10,786	129.0
<b>Office of the Director General</b>	43	4,726	4,683	37	4,720	25.0
<b>Young People</b>	800	4,004	3,204	8	3,212	54.0
<b>Skills and Student Finance</b>	585	20,095	19,510	-	19,510	41
<b>Total:</b>	<b>21,220</b>	<b>210,908</b>	<b>189,688</b>	<b>125</b>	<b>189,813</b>	<b>2,559.0</b>

<b>Justice and Home Affairs</b>						
<b>Service Area</b>	<b>Near Cash Income (£000)</b>	<b>Near Cash Expenditure (£000)</b>	<b>Net Revenue Expenditure (£000)</b>	<b>Non Cash Depreciation (£000)</b>	<b>Total Net Revenue Expenditure (£000)</b>	<b>FTE</b>
<b>Health and Safety Inspectorate</b>	-	579	579	-	579	7.0
<b>States of Jersey Ambulance Service</b>	16	6,201	6,185	73	6,258	78.0
<b>States of Jersey Fire and Rescue Service</b>	312	6,391	6,079	141	6,220	81.0
<b>States of Jersey Prison Service</b>	622	11,149	10,527	269	10,796	152
<b>Jersey Field Squadron</b>	-	1,512	1,512	-	1,512	5.0
<b>Jersey Customs and Immigration Service</b>	2,617	7,932	5,315	313	5,628	89.0
<b>Justice and Home Affairs Directorate</b>	327	5,108	4,781	204	4,985	53.0
<b>Superintendent Registrar</b>	636	828	192	-	192	11.4
<b>Total:</b>	<b>4,530</b>	<b>39,700</b>	<b>35,170</b>	<b>1,000</b>	<b>36,170</b>	<b>476.4</b>

States of Jersey Police						
Service Area	Near Cash Income (£000)	Near Cash Expenditure (£000)	Net Revenue Expenditure (£000)	Non Cash Depreciation (£000)	Total Net Revenue Expenditure (£000)	FTE
States of Jersey Police Service	234	27,342	27,108	650	27,758	357.0
<b>Total:</b>	<b>234</b>	<b>27,342</b>	<b>27,108</b>	<b>650</b>	<b>27,758</b>	<b>357.0</b>

The Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026 does not set out the resources allocated to the Ministers, however, the Panel asked for clarification about this. It was confirmed to the Panel that:

- The resources allocated to the Minister for Children and Education’s portfolio directly align with that of the Department for Children, Education, Young People and Skills (CYPES)<sup>6</sup>; and
- The resources allocated to the Minister for Home Affairs’ portfolio incorporated the States of Jersey Police Head of Expenditure and the majority of the Justice and Home Affairs Head of Expenditure, with the exception of the funding for the Health and Safety inspectorate which was the responsibility of the Minister for Social Security.<sup>7</sup>

The Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel has made an overarching recommendation (number 5) that ‘*Future Government Plans must provide detailed Ministerial mapping for departmental budgets which includes a detailed breakdown of how funding is split between programmes and services when lodged. This mapping must be apparent in the Ministerial Plans so that it is clear as to how the workstreams and policy initiatives laid out in the Ministerial Plans align and appear in the Government Plan as funding proposals*’.<sup>8</sup> See Appendix 2 for further details.

Changes to the net Revenue Expenditure for departmental budgets are included on page 102 of the Government Plan 2023-2026. Extracts from this table are detailed below, for reference:

Changes to Net Revenue Expenditure Children, Young People, Education and Skills <sup>9</sup>	
	(£000)
2022 Approval	167,478
Inflation and Formula Driven	1,359
Previous Revenue Growth	2,370
New Revenue Growth	16,458
Pay Awards	4,186

<sup>6</sup> [Letter, Minister for Children and Education, 8<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

<sup>7</sup> [Letter, Minister for Home Affairs, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

<sup>8</sup> Government Plan 2023-26 Review ([S.R. 20/2022](#)), Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel

<sup>9</sup> ‘[Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026](#)’, p.102

Service Area Transfers	(1,475)
Value for Money Savings	(688)
2023 Estimate	189,688
<b>Net Difference 2022 to 2023</b>	<b>22,210</b>

<b>Changes to Net Revenue Expenditure Justice and Home Affairs<sup>10</sup></b>	
	<b>(£000)</b>
2022 Approval	30,746
Inflation and Formula Driven	223
Previous Revenue Growth	162
New Revenue Growth	2,839
Pay Awards	776
Service Area Transfers	568
Value for Money Savings	(144)
2023 Estimate	35,170
<b>Net Difference 2022 to 2023</b>	<b>4,424</b>

<b>Changes to Net Revenue Expenditure States of Jersey Police<sup>11</sup></b>	
	<b>(£000)</b>
2022 Approval	25,205
Inflation and Formula Driven	110
Previous Revenue Growth	141
New Revenue Growth	1,025
Pay Awards	651
Service Area Transfers	93
Value for Money Savings	(117)
2023 Estimate	27,108
<b>Net Difference 2022 to 2023</b>	<b>1,903</b>

The Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026 provides the public with detail about the new revenue expenditure programmes (detailed further in section 6 of this report), however there is no information to detail a full list of projects and programmes to be delivered under each Departmental Head of Expenditure.

<sup>10</sup> [‘Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026’](#), p.102

<sup>11</sup> [ibid](#)

The Panel asked for information about all programmes and projects under the departmental Heads of Expenditure by letter. The Minister for Children and Education advised that:

*The full list of programmes and projects for 2023 will be detailed in the CYPES Department Delivery Plan. This will be made available in January. I would also like to refer the Panel to the published Ministerial Plans, which outlines my priorities for 2023.*<sup>12</sup>

The Minister for Home Affairs provided a list of the new revenue expenditure projects, as listed within the Proposed Government Plan document<sup>13</sup>.

The Panel understands that the Delivery Plans will not be published until early 2023, however, the States Assembly is being asked to approve the transfers to the consolidated fund as part of the Government Plan proposition. The Panel suggests that this does not allow for proper scrutiny of the Heads of Expenditure.

#### FINDING 1



At the time of this report, there is not a publicly available list of projects and programmes to be delivered under the heads of expenditure for the Departments of Children, Education, Young People and Skills, Justice and Home Affairs, and the States of Jersey Police, the available breakdown of spend in these departments is detailed in the Service Level Analysis of the Appendix.

The Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel's overarching recommendation, number 8 also addresses this: 'To enhance transparency and accountability of the Government Plan process, the Council of Ministers must include detail in relation to ongoing expenditure and business as usual projects within future Government Plans'.<sup>14</sup>

## Covid-19 Response and Recovery Spending

The Government Plan 2023-2026 details a £25 million provision for direct costs of the Covid-19 pandemic in 2023, of this £2.215 million has been allocated for CYPES Post-Covid-19 Requirements.

The Annex acknowledges that 'CYPES has been one of the most severely impacted government services during the pandemic'<sup>15</sup> and that the 'additional budget in 2023 is intended to enable CYPES to manage the costs of mitigating actions to prevent and address these risks and issues'.<sup>16</sup>

The Panel asked for further details of the £2.215 million of funding allocated to CYPES for post COVID requirements in 2023 and was advised that:

*The business case estimate assumed that the additional operating costs in 2023 will be similar to those experienced in 2020 and 2021. The budget is not allocated out to schools or other budget holders. Instead, any cost which is incurred as a result of covid may be charged to it, and this is subject to internal challenge and to audit. The majority of staff-related costs in 2020 and 2021 have been for absence cover due to covid whereas 2022 has seen less spend on staff cover as at the end of October and more*

<sup>12</sup> [Letter, Minister for Children and Education, 8<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

<sup>13</sup> [Letter, Minister for Home Affairs, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

<sup>14</sup> Government Plan 2023-26 Review (S.R. 20/2022), Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel

<sup>15</sup> 'Annex' to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 83

<sup>16</sup> [Ibid](#)

on cleaning and environmental protections such as ventilation and air filtration. The table below shows the planning assumption:

Cost	2023 £
Staff-related costs	1,785,000
Cleaning services	238,000
Cleaning products	102,000
Additional utility costs	60,000
Air filtration units	30,000
Other incidental costs	0
<b>Total Costs</b>	<b>2,215,000</b>

17

In a written submission to the Panel from NASUWT, the Teachers' Union, concurred with the assessment of the Covid-19 pandemic's impact on the education system and fully supported the additional measures to prevent and limit the spread of the virus. The NASUWT also advised that '*a significant number of pupils are also likely to be still experiencing issues due to falling behind during the pandemic. The Government must ensure that sufficient funding is provided to allow these pupils to catch up with their peers.*'<sup>18</sup>

The Panel received a submission from Every Child Our Future which (in a section relating to the additional revenue funding for 'Education Reform – Inclusion Review') also referenced the wider impacts of the Covid-19 pandemic on children's learning (see full submission [here](#)), particularly language and communication skills<sup>19</sup>.

The Panel noted that educational impact is not included in post Covid-19 spend, it is to facilitate operational cost.

The Panel also noted that there is no budget for post Covid-19 funding from 2024 onwards and that the Government Plan states that '*In future plans these will begin to be incorporated into departmental expenditure, to reflect the ongoing costs of living with Covid-19.*'<sup>20</sup> The Panel asked whether services would receive additional uplifts to their budgets to accommodate the costs. The response stated that:

*There are no automatic budget uplifts for Covid planned for 2024. A business case will be required to be put forward through the government plan process for 2024 to secure further one-off or recurring funding if this is deemed to be required when reviewed at the end of 2022 and early part of 2023.*<sup>21</sup>

The Panel notes that, for schools, there is no provision in the Jersey Funding Formula for Covid related cleaning material costs, or pandemic recovery and is therefore concerned that future departmental expenditure could be squeezed to accommodate post-Covid cleaning requirements as the new normal.

<sup>17</sup> [Letter, Minister for Children and Education, 8<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

<sup>18</sup> [Written submission, NASUWT, The Teachers Union](#)

<sup>19</sup> [Written submission, Every Child Our Future](#)

<sup>20</sup> 'Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026', p.41

<sup>21</sup> [Letter, Minister for Children and Education, 8<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

**FINDING 2**

£2.215 million is available to the Department of Children, Education, Young People and Skills in 2023 for post Covid-19 requirements. £1.78 million has been budgeted for staff costs and the remainder on cleaning and environmental protections.

**FINDING 3**

No funding has been allocated for post Covid-19 costs after 2023. Additional funding (whether one off expenditure or recurring) will need to be put forward through the Government Plan process for 2024.

**RECOMMENDATION 1**

The Minister for Children and Education should ensure that suitable plans are made for related Covid-19 costs from 2024 onwards and that this should not squeeze departmental budgets. The Minister should also explore the wider impacts of Covid-19 on Jersey children's education and development to establish whether any further funding will be required to address this in future Government Plans.

## 6 New programmes in the Government Plan 2023-26

### Summary of Revenue Expenditure Growth (GP 2023-26)

The tables below identify the programmes that will receive first-time investment in 2023.

New Additional Revenue Expenditure Programmes Children, Young People, Education and Skills <sup>22</sup>					
Description	Reference	2023 Estimate (£000)	2024 Estimate (£000)	2025 Estimate (£000)	2026 Estimate (£000)
Education Reform – Inclusion Review	I-CYPES-GP23-001	6,105	6,105	6,105	6,105
Children's Social Care Reform	I-CYPES-GP23-002	6,554	6,554	6,554	6,554
Demographics and Needs Assessments	I-CYPES-GP23-003	1,840	2,977	3,329	4,863
Social Worker Recruitment and Retention	I-CYPES-GP23-004	1,800	1,350	900	450
Jersey Premium – Virtual School	I-CYPES-GP23-005	159	159	159	159

<sup>22</sup> 'Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026', Appendix 3, p.98

100 Day Plan – School Meals (Reserves)	I-CYPES-GP23-006	1,654	1,611	1,671	1,701
<b>Total</b>		<b>18,112</b>	<b>18,756</b>	<b>18,718</b>	<b>19,832</b>

<b>New Additional Revenue Expenditure Programmes Justice and Home Affairs<sup>23</sup></b>					
<b>Description</b>	<b>Reference</b>	<b>2023 Estimate (£000)</b>	<b>2024 Estimate (£000)</b>	<b>2025 Estimate (£000)</b>	<b>2026 Estimate (£000)</b>
Parish Registrations	I-JHA-GP23-001	207	207	207	207
Ambulance Service	I-JHA-GP23-002	1,010	1,192	1,246	1,246
Fire and Rescue Service	I-JHA-GP23-003	495	930	1,238	1,238
Combined control room	I-JHA-GP23-004	703	859	447	415
Brexit – Increased activity and border compliance	I-JHA-GP23-005	155	208	208	208
Governance and Performance	I-JHA-GP23-006	155	155	155	155
Jersey Care Commission – Regulation Management	I-JHA-GP23-007	114	168	168	168
TETRA Extension	I-JHA-GP23-008	-	250	250	250
<b>Total</b>		<b>2,839</b>	<b>3,969</b>	<b>3,919</b>	<b>3,887</b>

<b>New Additional Revenue Expenditure Programmes States of Jersey Police<sup>24</sup></b>					
<b>Description</b>	<b>Reference</b>	<b>2023 Estimate (£000)</b>	<b>2024 Estimate (£000)</b>	<b>2025 Estimate (£000)</b>	<b>2026 Estimate (£000)</b>
Police Resourcing	I-SoJP-GP23-001	500	500	500	500

<sup>23</sup> [Ibid, p.98](#)

<sup>24</sup> [Ibid, p.100](#)

Victim Support	I-SoJP-GP23-002	325	325	325	325
Associated Costs of Domestic Abuse Law	I-SoJP-GP23-003	200	200	200	200
<b>Total</b>		<b>1,025</b>	<b>1,025</b>	<b>1,025</b>	<b>1,025</b>

New Additional Revenue Expenditure Programmes Non-Ministerial (relating to Probation Service only) <sup>25</sup>					
Description	Reference	2023 Estimate (£000)	2024 Estimate (£000)	2025 Estimate (£000)	2026 Estimate (£000)
Probation Officer	I-PROB-GP23-001	77	154	154	154

## Detail on Additional Revenue Programmes

The following section provides the Panel's analysis of each new additional revenue expenditure programme:

### Programmes within Children, Young People, Education and Skills

I-CYPES-GP23-001: Education Reform – Inclusion Review
Children, Young People, Education and Skills

### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023-2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
6,105	6,105	6,105	6,105

### Overview

The Annex explains that '*this investment is aimed at addressing the identified, yet unmet, needs in the education system for our children and young people with additional needs*<sup>26</sup> and that it '*...includes direct investment in schools, restructuring and scaling up of existing provisions and development of new provisions.*<sup>27</sup>

### Panel analysis

The Panel wanted to understand whether the proposed additional funding would address the fifty recommendations from the [Independent Review of Inclusive Education and Early Years](#)

<sup>25</sup> [Ibid, p.101](#)

<sup>26</sup> '[Annex](#)' to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 50

<sup>27</sup> [Ibid](#)

undertaken by the Government of Jersey in 2021. That review had focussed on ‘*how schools, settings and support services contribute to, or are barriers to, inclusion at a system level*’.<sup>28</sup>

In a public hearing the Minister for Children and Education referenced this context, and explained that previous reports were a driver for the additional funding programme:

***The Minister for Children and Education:***

*[...] Basically we all know an evidence-based is clear that our support for children, additional needs for children, multilingual learners, children from different backgrounds, is not sufficient. It was clear from our reports. Also, we know that to make sure that we are addressing these needs we need to have enough people who would work with them.*<sup>29</sup>

### Funding

The Panel sought to ascertain what the proposed funding, of £6.1 million, would be used for in 2023. From the summary provided in the Annex, the following specific resources are identified as part of the programme expenditure, however, there is no detail provided on how the funding for these aspects will be allocated:

- A Special Educational Needs Coordinator;
- Designated Safeguarding Lead;
- Education Welfare Officer;
- Emotional Literacy Support Assistant;
- Record of Need support;
- The teaching assistant workforce (specifically to grow the capacity and capability);
- Changes to existing Additional Resource Centres (ARCs); and
- Development of new ARCs in both primary and secondary schools.

The Panel asked the Minister for a detailed breakdown of the £6.1 million allocated to ‘Education Reform – Inclusion Review’ for 2023 and was provided with the following information:

<b>Workstream</b>	<b>2023 Funding £'000</b>
Inclusion funding formula	3,257
Inclusion - other	907
Early years inclusion	967
Recruitment & retention	974
<b>Total for ERP / Inclusion</b>	<b>6,105</b>

30

With regards to the four workstreams listed in the table above, the following detail was also provided:

<sup>28</sup> [Independent Review of Inclusive Education and Early Years](#), Nasen International on behalf of the Government of Jersey, December 2021, p.5

<sup>29</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#), p. 13

<sup>30</sup> [Letter, Minister for Children and Education, 17<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

*'The inclusion funding formula establishes the funds required to address unmet needs in the education system, with particular focus on children with special educational needs (SEN).*

*Inclusion – other reflects the estimated implementation costs of other recommendations of the nasen inclusion review where implementation will start in 2023. The financial implications of recommendations due for implementation after 2023 will be considered in future Government Plans.*

*Early years inclusion encompasses the cost of provision for targeted support for 2-3 year olds with SEN along with an increase in portage and special educational needs coordinator (SENCO) roles.*

*Recruitment and retention includes resources to support growth in school workforce capacity.<sup>31</sup>*

The Panel notes that the [Jersey Funding Formula for Schools: Rationale and Calculations 2022](#) (published in October 2022), provides an explanation about the calculation of the base inclusion funding for schools, including detail about some of the roles and resources in the bullet points above. The Panel has been offered more detail on the above workstreams in a private briefing on the Inclusion programme and understands that further detail will be publicly shared about the programme and funding as it develops.

#### FINDING 4



The Government will invest £6.1 million in 2023 to better support schools with resources for the purposes of 'inclusion' for children with needs that are unmet by the current education system. The money will fund new staff roles and Additional Resource Centres in all mainstream primary and secondary schools. The funding is recurring and £6.1 million is proposed for each year of this Government Plan.

#### Scope and Oversight

In a quarterly public hearing, the Minister provided the Panel with the working definition of 'inclusive education':

##### **The Minister for Children and Education:**

*... Inclusive education is where every child feels valued and respected and has access to and is able to participate in learning, demonstrating their capacity to reach their full social and academic potential regardless of their background, personal characteristics and individual need. This is our working definition. Why I am saying about working definition, because we have an oversight board and we have a delivery board that has just been formed. A delivery board will engage with all stakeholders because we started to work.<sup>32</sup>*

<sup>31</sup> [Letter, Minister for Children and Education, 17<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

<sup>32</sup> [Transcript, Quarterly Public Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education, 20<sup>th</sup> October 2022, p. 10](#)

The Panel believes that the definition for ‘inclusive education’ will be vital in setting the objectives and assessing the outcomes of the inclusion programme. Further details were requested about the delivery board and it was explained that:

**Programme Director, Education Reform:**

*‘...we have established a delivery board where we have a chair, who is the director general of Justice and Home Affairs, Kate Briden, independent of the department, to lead the challenge and a robust assessment of delivery. That board also has an independent expert in the world of children with special educational needs to provide both the chair and the overall delivery board with some further challenge and insight into how things are best delivered. We have been very, very clear to focus on quality of implementation and, your earlier words, sustainability of that implementation. What we put in place has to stay in place for the benefit of those children. If it starts to unfold at all or peel back we know that is not good.’<sup>33</sup>*

The Panel received a submission from Every Child Our Future which ‘endorses the attention and funding directed towards a fuller understanding and provision for children with a range of additional needs’<sup>34</sup> however, suggested that there should also be two areas of additional need specifically mentioned and considered essential, namely ‘speech and language’ and ‘literacy and numeracy’<sup>35</sup>. The submission contained some statistics which are of concern to the Panel, including that:

*Exacerbated by the Covid pandemic, there are alarming numbers of children entering nursery and Reception with delayed language and communication skills. In one school nursery more than 2/3s of the intake fell below the levels expected.*

*[...]*

*Some 25% - 30% of Jersey’s non-fee paying primary school children still move into secondary school with literacy and numeracy levels below that which enables full participation in the curriculum.’<sup>36</sup>*

The indicators of Pupil Need, used for the inclusion base funding calculation, include pupils with low prior attainment as an indicator. The Panel would like some further information about the data collected and utilised by Children, Education, Young People and Skills (CYPES) to calculate the inclusion base funding for these aspects, in order to ascertain whether it will be sufficient going forward. The Panel queries how the department can be sure that ‘unmet needs’ are being captured in data used to calculate the funding formula.

#### FINDING 5



The Education Reform Inclusion Review programme will be overseen by an Inclusion Delivery Board chaired by the Director General of Justice and Home Affairs. The board membership also includes an independent expert in the world of children with special educational needs.

<sup>33</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p.18](#)

<sup>34</sup> [Written submission – Every Child Our Future](#)

<sup>35</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>36</sup> [Ibid](#)



## RECOMMENDATION 2

Details of the membership and terms of reference of the Inclusion Delivery Board, including should be made public.

### Additional Resource Centres

Additional Resource Centres (ARCs) form part of mainstream schools and support students with specialist needs. As referenced above, there are plans to change some of the existing ARCs and, also, to develop new ones in both primary and secondary schools. Existing ARCs (in primary schools) are:

**Rouge Bouillon** – Autistic Spectrum and Social Communication Needs

**Bel Royal** – Physical Needs

**St Clements** – Hearing and Deaf Support Needs

**St Saviour** – Autistic Spectrum and Social Communication Needs<sup>37</sup>

The changes to existing ARCs (as described in the Annex) are that they ‘*will be repurposed to provide a more general level of support embracing a wider range of needs and increasing the capacity of this important provision.*’<sup>38</sup> The Panel learned about the increased need and likely future requirements for ARCs in a public hearing with the Minister:

#### **The Minister for Children and Education:**

*[...] we need to make sure that we have enough A.R.C. (additional resource centre) provision and this work is really ongoing because before we have A.R.C. provision for autism or A.R.C. provision for hearing. What we are looking at to have is an A.R.C. provision more general but to have it in each school. It is not just only 2 schools or 3 schools that receive the children with ... it is almost in every school. We spoke about the secondary schools, so each secondary school will need to have their own A.R.C. general provision, so the children who live next to one school do not need to travel to other schools because the only hearing special provision would be in that school. We need to make sure and it is very clear. I think we are more aware, we have more diagnoses. The numbers of referrals for neuro and diverse assessment increased or half of C.A.M.H.S.’s assessment, half of C.A.M.H.S.’s referrals around 600-plus. It is around assessment for A.D.H.D. (attention deficit hyperactivity disorder) and autism. It is the numbers that we know and we need to provide and we need to arrange. Nobody expected, I think, or nobody planned for these numbers some year ago<sup>39</sup>.*

The Minister for Children and Education has referenced increased awareness and diagnosis of other additional needs and, as referenced by a submission in the ‘Scope and Oversight’ section above, there are suggestions of high levels of pupils with low prior attainment. The Panel queries what data Children, Education, Young People and Skills, (and Health and Community Services, where relevant) is collecting (and sharing) to monitor possible trends, and determine current and predict future needs for Education provision.

<sup>37</sup> [Jersey Funding Formula for Schools: Rationale and Calculations 2022](#), Government of Jersey, p.13

<sup>38</sup> ‘[Annex](#)’ to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 50

<sup>39</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p.18](#)

In a written submission from Autism Jersey, it was stated that ‘*the development of new ARCs is welcome*’<sup>40</sup> however, the following point was made with regards to the changes to existing provision:

*You refer to the repurposing of ARCs to provide a ‘more general level of support embracing a wider range of needs’. Autism Jersey wish to raise their concerns regarding the detail of what this actually means, and for these changes not to dilute the essential support provided to autistic children seeking to remain in mainstream education, whose communication and sensory needs can often be prohibitive.*<sup>41</sup>

The Panel asked about the engagement had taken place with schools to develop the proposals for the inclusion programme. It was advised that:

**Programme Director, Education Reform:**

*[...] there are several different aspects of the inclusion programme where schools have been involved; it is often through headteachers or through their special educational needs co-ordinators. We have work around how funding is allocated to schools for the benefit of children through the inclusion review and we have headteachers of course who sits on that group. The Minister has quite frequently been meeting groups of headteachers and this has been very much part of the conversation. Our central inclusion team as recently as last week met with all of the primary headteachers and the secondary headteachers.*<sup>42</sup>

The Panel was also advised that a consultation on the Inclusion programme, which would include feedback from parents, would start in December (2022) or January 2023 and conclude in June 2023<sup>43</sup>.

#### FINDING 6



The Panel has been advised that there are increasing levels of need across a wide spectrum of both mental and physical requirements in children. There are also needs arising because of low levels of prior attainment. Pupil need is calculated using indicators of Pupil Need within the new Jersey Funding Formula for Schools.



#### RECOMMENDATION 3

The Minister for Children and Education should consult with headteachers during 2023 about the suitability of the new Jersey Funding Formula for schools and the results of that feedback should be made public.



#### FINDING 7

It is proposed that existing specialist Additional Resource Centres (ARCs) are to be repurposed in order to provide a wider range of support to students with

<sup>40</sup> [Written submission, Autism Jersey](#)

<sup>41</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>42</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p.22](#)

<sup>43</sup> [Ibid, p.22 /23](#)

additional needs. New ARCs will be developed in almost every primary and secondary school.



#### RECOMMENDATION 4

The Minister for Children and Education should ensure that parents and other stakeholders are specifically consulted on the proposed changes to existing specialist Additional Resource Centres.

### Staff and recruitment

In a public hearing on 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022 the Minister confirmed that 117 staff would be recruited as part of the additional funding programme for inclusion. The Panel had previously heard about recruitment challenges for various sectors, including schools. The Panel questioned this figure with the Minister and learned that approximately 30 of those 117 roles were already in the system, but not on full contracts.<sup>44</sup>

The Programme Director recognised that further staff resource was a frequent theme of feedback and acknowledged that recruitment was a challenge. He explained that upskilling existing staff would help to support capacity:

#### ***Programme Director, Education Reform:***

*... An example there is that we have been putting all of our S.E.N.C.o. (special educational needs co-ordinator) community through Masters level qualifications around special education needs co-ordination in order that they can then help the school, the leadership of the school, better plan and provide for that school's group of children who need additional support. Lots of other aspects around building capacity and building capability in direct response to feedback from our schools, much of which the Minister has heard first hand.<sup>45</sup>*

The Panel was also advised that the Council of Ministers would consider further funding for more recruitment, if that was identified as a requirement.<sup>46</sup>

The Panel received submissions which were concerned about the delivery of the programmes due to staffing and resource shortages. The NASUWT, The Teachers' Union, noted its concerns about recruitment in its submission to the Panel:

*Put simply, if there are insufficient teachers in the system, additional resources and infrastructure will count for very little. There is plentiful research evidence which shows the quality of an education system cannot exceed the quality of its teachers.*

*Jersey is in the midst of a recruitment and retention crisis, and without matching investment in the workforce, it is unlikely that additional investment in the system will reach its full potential.<sup>47</sup>*

<sup>44</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p.15](#)

<sup>45</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>46</sup> [Ibid, p.16](#)

<sup>47</sup> [Written submission, NASUWT](#)

Specifically with regard to the Inclusion programme, it stated that:

*The success of the proposals will, however, hinge on the ability of CYPES to recruit additional SEND [special educational needs and disabilities] teachers and support staff, which, as noted above, may well be challenging.*<sup>48</sup>

Similar themes were echoed in the submission to the Panel from the charity, Every Child Our Future;

*If the initiatives already in the Government Plan and the priorities of the Ministerial Plans are to be met, the risk is all in the delivery. This manpower gap is the most critical issue to resolve. There will be no value for money if the plans are undertaken without the requisite level of resource and skills. And Jersey's children will not be well-served.*<sup>49</sup>

The Minister for Children and Education said, in a public hearing with the Panel, in reference to whether funding for staff would be held centrally or go to schools that 'funding needs to follow the need'<sup>50</sup>. She explained that some funding would be held centrally so that support could be provided to the school, to the child, and to the family.<sup>51</sup> The Minister recognised that coordinating the services would be a challenge, but she confirmed that it was a top priority.<sup>52</sup>

The requirement for joined up processes between Government departments was highlighted by Every Child Our Future:

*If the investment recommended in the Government Plan is to make a demonstrable difference, there has to be not only mechanisms in place to make cross-departmental activities operate smoothly but also a shared resolve to make them work in a timely manner for the support of children.*<sup>53</sup>



#### FINDING 8

There will be 117 staff recruited as part of the Inclusion programme. This will include new staff and also some existing staff put on new contracts. There are some concerns about skilled recruitment challenges in educational settings and therefore whether this number of staff is achievable in 2023.

### I-CYPES-GP23-002: Children's Social Care Reform

#### Children, Young People, Education and Skills

#### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023-2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
6,554	6,554	6,554	6,554

#### Overview

<sup>48</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>49</sup> [Written submission, Every Child Our Future](#)

<sup>50</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p.13](#)

<sup>51</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>52</sup> [Ibid, p.14](#)

<sup>53</sup> [Written submission, Every Child Our Future](#)

The Annex states that this investment will ‘fund a comprehensive reform of the system of care in Jersey’<sup>54</sup> which relates to children in the care of the Minister.

### Panel analysis

The Panel was advised that this programme was made up of 5 strategic priorities, and that there were new requirements following the enactment of the Children and Young People’s Law:

#### The Minister for Children and Education:

*The request basically involved a comprehensive reform of the system of care in Jersey through the main 5 work streams. Most of them will also be statutory requirements with enacting of the Children and Young People Law so it is really important to understand. So there are strategic priorities within this business case.*<sup>55</sup>

The Panel has established some details about the 5 workstreams of the ‘Children’s Social Care Reform’ programme in the public hearing with the Minister for Children and Education on 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022. The [transcript](#) of the hearing provides further detail on pages 24-26.

The Panel subsequently asked for a detailed breakdown of the £6.5 million allocated to ‘Children’s Social Care Reform’ for 2023 and was provided with the following table:

Workstream	2023 Funding £’000
The Future – this priority is the reform of the social care service underpinned by improvement. New staff are required to work on practice improvement, redesign and future planning and oversight of services	639
Staying Together – with a focus on keeping families together in the community which will include staff to expand services in early help in government and third sector services.	1,193
Providing Loving Homes – this priority will see the expansion of foster homes and residential children’s homes with the associated required additional staff to care for children in the care of the Minister. Additional staff will also be required to ensure quality and standards.	3,874
Working Together – additional roles are required here to develop training and staff competency framework,	466
Thriving Together – this priority is about supporting young people from the care of the Minister into adulthood and providing expanded accommodation options with appropriate staffing levels.	384
<b>Total for Children’s Social Care Reform</b>	<b>6,556</b>

56

<sup>54</sup> ‘Annex’ to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 51

<sup>55</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p.26](#)

<sup>56</sup> [Letter, Minister for Children and Education, 17<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

The Panel has found that, so far, plans within this programme are fairly high level, with no tangible policy or detail about the reform of how the Children’s Social Care Service will be changed.

The Annex to the Government Plan references possible key partners for certain key services, for example Jersey Cares, NSPCC Jersey, and Brighter Futures. The Panel received a submission from the NSPCC which stated that:

*We appreciate being named as a partner agency within the document and look forward to working with Government to drive improvement and better quality of service outcome. [...] There is little detail in the Government Plan about what specifically any reform programme looks like and we have, as yet, not been involved in any detailed discussion.*<sup>57</sup>

The NSPCC’s submission (which can be read in full [here](#)) identified a number of key principles that any reform of Children’s Social Care should take. This included:

- The increase of early help support;
- Take children’s wishes and feelings into account for all aspects of the plan and ensure that ‘*support for recovery is available and is built around the child*’;
- Working better together, including other partner agencies; and
- Have sustainable and fair funding for services.<sup>58</sup>

The Panel noted that the workstream ‘providing loving homes’ had the highest proportion of funding for the programme, namely £3.874 million in 2023. It relates to the expansion of foster homes, improvements to children’s residential homes and the increase of staff provision to ensure quality and standards are maintained.

The Annex also references the acquiring of an ‘*on-Island residential therapeutic care facility as an alternative to placing children off-Island in specialist resources. This development will contribute to a reduction in children being placed off-Island.*’<sup>59</sup> This has been examined further in section 9 of this report. The Panel is fully supportive of the drive to secure on-Island care for children and young people and would like to see further details about the long-term sustainability for this plan during 2023.

## FINDING 9



There will be a process to comprehensively reform Children’s Social Care in Jersey. This is in response to statutory requirements from the Children and Young People’s Law. Whilst the high-level priorities and workstreams have been identified, there is further clarity required on the underlying detail and measurable outcomes for the programme, which is projected to require £6.5 million per year between 2023 and 2026.

## Staff

The Panel noted that there is a proposed increase of 82.5 FTE (full-time equivalent) staff for ‘Children’s safeguarding’ in this year’s Government Plan (344 FTE), compared to last year (266.5 FTE) and asked for some further detail about the roles. The Panel was directed to

<sup>57</sup> [Written submission, NSPCC Jersey](#)

<sup>58</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>59</sup> [Annex](#) to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 51

details of the Social Care Reform Programme and was advised that ‘*These posts include senior management posts providing robust management, leadership and oversight of services and practice, social workers, training officers, staff to drive quality assurance and standards, residential staff including managers and residential childcare officers and family partnership workers.*’<sup>60</sup>

Workforce challenges are a recognised issue and addressing this is one of the priorities the Minister for Children and Education has identified for 2023.<sup>61</sup> The issues specific to social workers are addressed in more detail later in this report. The Panel noted that many of the workstreams listed in the table above detail ‘new staff’, ‘staff to expand services’, ‘additional staff’, ‘additional roles’ and ‘appropriate staffing levels’. The Panel is supportive of restructuring to create a suitable workforce structure but highlights the risk of any change and particularly an increase in skilled staff as being unviable.

In its written submission to the Panel the NSPCC highlighted the importance of stabilising the Children’s Social Care workforce and also building relationships with other partners:

*As well as stabilising the workforce a focus on working together better with other partners must be strengthened to secure better outcomes for children. The new Children and Young People (Jersey) law 2022 provides the opportunity to work together better supported by clear guidance and procedures.*<sup>62</sup>

### Partnership Working

The Panel notes that the importance of connected working between Government and partners in the context of Children’s Social Care Reform has been recognised within the proposed Ministerial Plans<sup>63</sup>.

The Minister’s plan states that ‘*children in the care of the Minister, and care leavers, will be supported by the Government to thrive and prepare to move into adulthood.*’<sup>64</sup> The Panel asked for more information about this in respect of the ‘thriving together’ workstream, and the Minister confirmed that there was also co-ordination with Andium Homes (the wholly States owned, but independent, company which provided housing in Jersey) for providing assistance to care leavers.<sup>65</sup>

Significant funding is being put into this programme and, based on the information provided to it so far, the Panel is supportive of its long-term goals. However, the Panel suggests that further detail about the programme specifics is required before proper scrutiny can be undertaken to assess whether the short-term nature of the funding is realistic.

---

<sup>60</sup> [Letter, Minister for Children and Education, 17<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

<sup>61</sup> Ministerial Plans ([R.139/2022](#)), p.13

<sup>62</sup> [Written submission, NSPCC Jersey](#)

<sup>63</sup> Ministerial Plans ([R.139/2022](#)), Government of Jersey, p.12

<sup>64</sup> *Ibid*

<sup>65</sup> [Transcript, Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p.27](#)

## I-CYPES-GP23-003: Demographics and Needs Assessments

### Children, Young People, Education and Skills

#### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023-2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
1,840	2,977	3,329	4,863

#### Overview

The Panel has established that this additional revenue funding is to increase the baseline level of funding for schools and educational services, including the Jersey Music Service.

The Annex explains that ‘*The Demographics funding is to ensure the volume of children in the education system in 2023 are funded in accordance with the established funding methodology. This investment is intended to cater for the changes in volume in the system, either at different phases of the education system or increasing numbers requiring specialist support.*’<sup>66</sup>

#### Panel analysis

As context, the Panel is aware of previous concerns regarding funding shortfalls. In its review of the Government Plan for 2022-2025, the formerly constituted Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel heard from stakeholders that there was a £23 million deficit for primary and secondary schools, as identified by a headteacher consultation<sup>67</sup>.

Since the time of that review, the [Jersey Funding Formula for Schools](#) has been updated (in October 2022). The level of the proposed additional baseline funding, £1.84 million in 2023, does not match the previously cited figure, however, the Panel has not had the opportunity to gather sufficient evidence and conduct a comparable analysis regarding the suitability of the calculation and funding proposals.

The Panel was advised that the forecast model for education funding requirements was reviewed on an annual basis.<sup>68</sup> It is also noted that the Jersey Funding Formula for Schools is described as ‘transitional’ to reflect a graduated change from the Average Weighted Pupil Unit (AWPU) formula and therefore further changes will be made:

*‘This transitional formula remains firmly work in progress. There are several sections planned for review in 2023 including elements of the staffing model in secondary schools and allocations of technology budget.’*<sup>69</sup>

The Panel has recommended (in Recommendation 3) that the Minister for Children and Education should consult with headteachers during 2023 about the suitability of the Jersey Funding Formula for Jersey Schools and that the feedback received should be shared.

#### ‘Elevated levels of need’

<sup>66</sup> ‘[Annex](#)’ to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 51

<sup>67</sup> Government Plan 2022-25 Review ([S.R.16/2021](#)), Children Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel, 8<sup>th</sup> December 2021, p.37

<sup>68</sup> [Transcript, Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p.31](#)

<sup>69</sup> [Jersey Funding Formula for Schools](#), Government of Jersey, October 2022, p.4

In addition to general demographics and population-based requirements, the Panel had noted that the Annex referenced that funding would support *'the prevalence of young people with elevated levels of need'*<sup>70</sup> and also *'Increased numbers of pupils with a 'Record of Need', and increased complexity of need, therefore requiring additional specialist support.'*<sup>71</sup> The Panel wanted to understand how this differed to the funding proposed to support the Inclusion programme. The Assistant Minister for Children and Education explained in a public hearing that:

*'This demographics is kind of business as usual but for more children and the inclusion, extra funding is on top of business-as-usual improved services for all of those children.'*<sup>72</sup>

The Panel highlights the central role of data to the 'Demographics and Needs Assessments' programme. This aligns with both the aims of the Ministerial plan, to ensure that education is shaped around children, their needs and their human rights<sup>73</sup> and the Common Strategic Policy statement that *'we will progress reforms to education, including developing better support for learners with particular needs.'*<sup>74</sup>

In a written submission to the Panel, Autism Jersey also highlighted the importance of data:

*Investment in data to map out demographics of the variety of needs of children in Jersey is welcome. This is essential to be able to forward plan the essential support required.*<sup>75</sup>

Clarity over certain aspects, for example, the numbers of individuals with elevated needs was highlighted to the Panel in the submission from Every Child Our Future. The Panel was advised that:

*In respect to the funding model used, however, which takes into account 'the prevalence of young people with elevated levels of need', we would expect that the definition is more than those children with or estimated to have a formal record of need and currently designated SEN by schools.'*

*'An indication of the percentage of children calculated to be in this category of "elevated" would be useful.'*<sup>76</sup>

The Panel highlights that correct data is essential to the success of the programme.

The Panel also received confirmation that there would be provision for more school counsellors as part of the needs assessment.<sup>77</sup>

---

<sup>70</sup> ['Annex'](#) to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 51

<sup>71</sup> [Ibid, p.51](#)

<sup>72</sup> [Transcript, Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p.33](#)

<sup>73</sup> Ministerial Plans ([R.139/2022](#)), Government of Jersey, p.11

<sup>74</sup> Common Strategic Policy ([P.98/2022](#)), Government of Jersey, p.13

<sup>75</sup> [Written submission, Autism Jersey](#)

<sup>76</sup> [Written submission, Every Child Our Future](#)

<sup>77</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p. 34](#)

**FINDING 10**

Further review and analysis is required regarding the suitability of the new funding formula used for the 'Demographics and Needs Assessments' programme.

**RECOMMENDATION 5**

The Minister for Children and Education should publicise the transitional aspects of the Jersey School Funding Formula and share further details about the data used for calculations.

Jersey Music Service

In the Annex to the Government Plan, it is stated that the funding in the Demographics and Needs Assessments programme would '*regularise the contractual status of the Jersey Music Service (JMS) tutors, who are currently employed on contracts for services*'<sup>78</sup>.

The Panel established that, during 2022, JMS tutors had been offered and moved (where consent was provided) to permanent contracts.<sup>79</sup> In a written submission to the Panel from the JMS:

*'No additional funding was provided for this transition in 2022 and therefore the service is struggling to contain the increased salary costs within the budget provision, while continuing to maintain services and provision and providing training and developmental opportunities to Instrumental Tutors.'*<sup>80</sup>

The Panel is pleased that the change has been made, in order to provide JMS tutors with career development pathways. However, the Panel suggests that fit-for-purpose and forward-looking funding and support for the JMS should be considered by the Minister, including provision of a fit-for-purpose location for music development is required (further detail is in section 9 of this report, under 'New School and Educational Developments' paragraph).

**FINDING 11**

Tutors at the Jersey Music Service (JMS) were offered permanent contracts of employment during 2022, however, that cost was not reflected in the budget for the JMS. The Panel is advised that the provision of this funding will support those roles from 2023 onwards.

Summary

The Panel believes that the 'Demographics and Needs Assessments' programme does, overall, align with the aims and objectives of the Ministerial priority to support children and young people to have the best education available to them. However, it suggests that further detail on the data collected and used should be shared to establish whether the programme and its funding is suitable for the needs of the Island's children and Education system.

<sup>78</sup> ['Annex'](#) to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 52

<sup>79</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p.33](#)

<sup>80</sup> [Written submission, Jersey Music Service](#)

## I-CYPES-GP23-004: Social Worker Recruitment and Retention

### Children, Young People, Education and Skills

#### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023-2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
1,800	1,350	900	450

#### Overview

The Annex explains that this additional revenue programme is an investment which is *‘intended to sustain the existing high cost of staff in the short term, but it is anticipated that the system re-design and re-provision will present a better opportunity for permanent recruitment so costs will decline over time.’*<sup>81</sup>

#### Panel analysis

The Panel notes that the funding proposed for the programme is to fill a short-term requirement for agency staff, with the expectation that the requirement will reduce by 2026.

The Panel asked for details about how social worker recruitment and retention funding would reduce reliance on temporary staff. The Minister outlined the avenues that the Children’s Services would take, namely:

- Look and learn from how other Government departments were recruiting and retaining social workers;
- Commission other services to undertake early intervention services;
- Support on-Island training of social workers. It was confirmed that there were 21 people currently on the locally run social work degree course;
- Explore the establishment of a graduate apprenticeship scheme in future.<sup>82</sup>

The Panel asked the Minister whether any themes had emerged from exit interviews with social workers leaving the employment of the Government. The Minister advised that:

*Completion rates of leaver surveys are generally low across CYPES and this means that we are unable to determine any themes from the survey around social workers leaving employment. I am grateful to the Panel for raising this issue and we will look to improve completion rates and identification of themes going forward.*<sup>83</sup>

The Panel suggests that it is vital to collect this feedback from departing employees in order to understand the problems and be able to address issues before they become endemic.

The Panel asked whether other avenues had been explored to create equality and a parity of pay for permanently based social workers in comparison to the packages offered to shorter term agency staff:

<sup>81</sup> [‘Annex’ to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026](#), p. 52

<sup>82</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p.35](#)

<sup>83</sup> [Letter, Minister for Children and Education, 17<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

**Deputy C.D. Curtis:**

[...] Just about retention strategy for staff who are already there, has a Jersey supplement payable equally to all social work staff been considered?

**The Minister for Children and Education:**

This is something that we raised and it is with S.E.B. [States Employment Board] and it is a discussion because I just do not want to go into the legalities because it has been raised.

[...]

It is not in my remit to decide about these particular contractual things.<sup>84</sup>

The Panel notes that there have been concerns about social worker recruitment and retention for some time and efforts have previously been made to reduce the reliance on agency and temporary staff. There still appears to be a problem and therefore, the Panel queries whether it is realistic to expect that the need for agency staff will reduce by the end of this Government term.

**FINDING 12**

The Funding for Social Worker Recruitment and Retention is £1.8 million in 2023 and this sum reduces annually through the rest of the Government Plan.

**RECOMMENDATION 6**

The Department of Children, Education, Young People and Skills should require all employees and agency staff to undertake an exit interview at the time they leave the Department or cease working for the Government of Jersey. Staff should have to 'opt out' of the exit interview, rather than 'opt in' and any reasons for opting out should be formally recorded. Information recorded from the exit interview process should be used as a way to gather constructive feedback and identify possible changes for the future.

**RECOMMENDATION 7**

The Minister for Children and Education should work with the States Employment Board to create a Jersey supplement for all permanent social workers to bring a parity of pay with temporary agency staff.

### I-CYPES-GP23-005: Jersey Premium – Virtual School

Children, Young People, Education and Skills

**Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023-2026 (£000):**

2023	2024	2025	2026
159	159	159	159

<sup>84</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p.37](#)

## Overview

The Annex to the Government Plan confirms that *'This investment is intended to provide additional support to eligible Looked After Children in school settings to best practice standards.'*<sup>85</sup>

## Panel analysis

The Jersey Premium provides targeted additional funding to schools for each pupil who is eligible for additional targeted educational funding support. Children who are, or have ever been, a Child Looked After are some of the pupils who are eligible for the Jersey Premium throughout their education in a Government of Jersey school or college<sup>86</sup>.

The Panel highlights that, in 2020, the States Assembly approved an amendment to the Government Plan 2021-2024 (P.130/2020: Second Amendment) to increase the funding for the Jersey Premium by £159,000. This was to offset a proposed reduction in funding of £159,000) to the Jersey Premium at that time, this level of funding matches that figure.

The Panel also highlights certain provisions required by the Draft Children and Young People (Jersey) Law, approved by the States Assembly in 2022, which required the Minister to appoint a person to promote the educational achievement of looked after children and formalise the role of the virtual school head.

The Panel requested confirmation of the number of pupils the Virtual School supports, the Minister confirmed that *'We are currently supporting 166 children on and off island from pre-school nursery age through to care leavers. This includes children who are looked after, children who have previously been looked after and care leavers.'*<sup>87</sup>

Although not specifically mentioned in the Ministerial plans and priorities for 2023, the Panel believes that this programme does broadly align with the objective to support children and young people to have the best education available to them, particularly support for children in care.

### I-CYPES-GP23-006: 100 Day Plan – School Meals

#### Children, Young People, Education and Skills

#### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023-2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
1,654	1,611	1,671	1,701

## Overview

As part of the Council of Minister's (CoM) initial 100 Day plan, there was a commitment to *Introduce legislation and funding to ensure that school children have access to one meal a day in school.*<sup>88</sup> The CoM is proposing £1.6 million funding as part of the Government Plan to

<sup>85</sup> 'Annex' to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 52

<sup>86</sup> [Jersey Premium \(gov.je\)](https://www.gov.je/Children-Young-People/Education-and-Skills/Jersey-Premium) (accessed 21/11/2022)

<sup>87</sup> [Letter, Minister for Children and Education, 17<sup>th</sup> November 2022](https://www.gov.je/Children-Young-People/Education-and-Skills/Letter-Minister-for-Children-and-Education-17th-November-2022)

<sup>88</sup> [Council of Ministers' 100 Day Plan \(gov.je\)](https://www.gov.je/Children-Young-People/Education-and-Skills/Council-of-Ministers-100-Day-Plan) (accessed 21/11/2022)

*'level up access to good quality nutritious food among children from low-income families. The funding will ensure that school children have access to one meal a day in school thereby addressing any health inequalities'.<sup>89</sup>*

### **Panel analysis**

The Panel was aware of the pilot scheme for school meal provision, which had been underway at a number of schools since 2019 (and extended due to the Covid-19 pandemic). Children in income support households are eligible to receive a free school meal and other students are, currently, able to receive a meal for the cost of £2.50. The Panel understands that the expansion of the scheme through this additional revenue funding will create provision for hot school meals in each of the primary schools. The Minister has highlighted that there are perceived to be wide benefits of this programme which include:

#### **The Minister for Children and Education:**

*[...] providing of hot meals for children is addressing so many needs on health, social and well-being, so I am completely dedicated to this as well as the Chief Minister.<sup>90</sup>*

### Scale

The Panel heard that the provision of school meals would require an increase to 4,000 meals per day.

#### **The Minister for Children and Education:**

*We need to upgrade from just under 500 meals a day that are delivered currently to more than 4,000 meals a day. It is not 200,000 as has been proposed before, 300,000. Now, if we need to deliver 4,000 meals a day ... there is a tender process in place, we are in the middle of it so I cannot speak about the details but we have definitely secured this funding which will require upgrading kitchen facilities. It is more than double what the current hospital deliver, so this is the scale. I am completely, completely convinced that this is the way forward and quicker is better. At the same time we need to put it right and make sure it is sustainable.<sup>91</sup>*

Not all of the 4,000 meals are free for the children, and some are still pay-per-user. The NASWUT advised that Panel that:

*The NASUWT concurs with the document's assessment of the value of the school meals service. The NASUWT, however, does not believe the statement is ambitious enough. There is plentiful research and international evidence that universal free school meals has an impact across all children, and, in particular, removes the stigma that may be attached to receiving means-tested free school meals. Universal free school meals are now in place for Key Stage One pupils in England, Primary 1-5 pupils in Scotland, whilst all primary-aged pupils in Wales will receive a free school meal from*

---

<sup>89</sup> ['Annex'](#) to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 52

<sup>90</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p.39](#)

<sup>91</sup> [Transcript, Quarterly Public Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education, 20<sup>th</sup> October 2022, p.36](#)

*2024. The NASUWT urges the Jersey Government to replicate this and adopt some degree of universal free school meals.<sup>92</sup>*

The Minister for Children and Education did highlight that the school meals process (through parental pre-payment where relevant) meant that children were not aware of who was receiving them for free:

*...it is really important that children do not need to pay because one of the difficulties sometimes is who is receiving school meals for free and who does not receive and children do not even need to think about it. They just go there and receive meals. Nobody knows who gets it for free and who needs to pay, and this is really important.<sup>93</sup>*

### Funding

The Panel requested further detail about why the programme was classified in 'Reserves' rather than 'Allocated' funding within the Government Plan. The Minister advised that Panel in writing that:

*This is because the project is still in the detailed policy, design and logistical planning phase, scheduled to be completed by the end of the year. Following the carrying out of sufficient due diligence, a preferred option for progression will be established and documented in an agreed upon final business case that builds upon the initial business case submitted to the Government Plan 2023 process. This then enables the project's funds, currently agreed in principle and held in reserves, to be drawdown and 'allocated' to the department to progress along the cost intensive execution phase of the delivery timetable.<sup>94</sup>*

### Costs for pay-per users

The Panel sought clarification on whether the £2.50 cost cap for the pay-per-service users of the school meal programme would remain. The Panel was advised that:

*There are no current plans to change the price, we want to ensure that School Meals are accessible to as many children as possible. As previously advised, the funds allocated to this initiative are based on the premise of 100% uptake among families eligible for free meals. Any surplus funds resulting from lower than 100% uptake are reinvested into the service to subsidise the cost of meals for paying parents/carers. The programme will continue to work in this way.<sup>95</sup>*

### Timescale

At a Quarterly Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education on 20<sup>th</sup> October 2022 the Panel heard that the school meals programme would expand from 2023, but that some schools would not get the service until 2024:

#### **The Minister for Children and Education:**

---

<sup>92</sup> [Written submission, NASUWT](#)

<sup>93</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p.40](#)

<sup>94</sup> [Letter, Minister for Children and Education, 17<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

<sup>95</sup> [Ibid](#)

*Some of the schools will be in 2023, some of the schools will be in 2024. The moment that funding is confirmed we need to put the logistics in place and make sure it is working because we want to include all schools.*<sup>96</sup>

The Panel welcomes the Minister's commitment to expand the school meals offering and looks forward to receiving further detail about the programme in 2023.

The Panel notes that the 100-day plan also referenced 'legislation' however, the Minister for Children and Education is yet to confirm whether any legislation will be updated in relation to school meal provision.

The Panel notes that this revenue expenditure growth programme aligns with the Ministerial priorities '*publishing and delivering the next phase of delivery of the school meals programme to States schools in Jersey.*'<sup>97</sup>



#### FINDING 13

Approval of the School Meals programme will fund the supply of 4,000 meals per day to be provided in the Island's primary schools. Further detail is required on the final business case for the delivery of the programme and confirmation of timescales.



#### FINDING 14

Free school meals are currently provided to all primary school pupils from income support families, with other children able to get meals at a cost of £2.50 per meal. The Minister confirmed that there were no current plans to change the price for pay-per-users, however, there are calls for the School Meals programme to be extended, so that a free school meal is provided to all pupils, not just those in receipt of income support.



#### RECOMMENDATION 8

The Minister for Children and Education should consider extending the free school meals programme to all children in mainstream States primary schools in order to remove any stigma attached to means tested meals.

### Programmes within Justice and Home Affairs

#### I-JHA-GP23-001: Parish Registrations

##### Justice and Home Affairs

#### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023-2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
207	207	207	207

#### Overview

<sup>96</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p.36](#)

<sup>97</sup> Ministerial Plans ([R.139/2022](#)), Government of Jersey, p.12

*...the Office of the Superintendent Registrar is now responsible for majority of all Island registrations. This has resulted in a considerable increase in demand.<sup>98</sup>*

### Panel analysis

The outbreak of COVID-19 in Jersey in March 2020 and the subsequent introduction of various emergency legislation, resulted in changes to the registration of Island births, deaths and marriages. The Annex to the Government Plan highlights that this change was the transfer of these registration responsibilities from the Parishes to the Office of the Superintendent Registrar (OSIR):

*the Superintendent Registrar assumed responsibility from the Parishes in March 2020 for all registrations on the Island of births, deaths, and marriages<sup>99</sup>*

The Panel noted in its review of Government Plan that this work would continue for Parishes that had requested the OSIR to continue to undertake such registrations, and that a funding allocation of £207k per year has been made available for each year (2023-2026), to help the OSIR meet the increased demand:

*...it has been agreed that this arrangement will continue in Parishes that have asked the Office of the Superintendent Registrar to continue undertaking these duties.<sup>100</sup>*

*The Government will provide the funds required to fully resource the Office of the Superintendent Registrar to enable it to deliver its functions.<sup>101</sup>*

The Panel decided to ask for more information about the transfer of responsibilities to the OSIR, in written correspondence to the Minister for Home Affairs (Minister). In response to the Panel's letter, the Minister advised that discussions about the OSIR transitional arrangements are ongoing. The Panel also learned that the Minister expected the OSIR to continue to operate within the purview of Customer and Local Services (CLS) until 31st December 2022, and receive the full support of CLS during this time:

*Officers are in discussions to ensure a smooth transition in relation to line management, facilities and processes... The Office of the Superintendent Registrar remains with Customer and Local Services until 31 December 2022 and I have sought an assurance that there will be no diminution in their support to the OSIR during that time.<sup>102</sup>*

The Panel also asked about the allocation of £207k to fund the OSIR delivery of Parish registrations, including whether this would allocate any money to upgrading or replacing computer systems and software used for registrations. It was advised that the costs were associated with additional staffing needs to meet increased demand:

---

<sup>98</sup> ['Annex'](#) to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 65

<sup>99</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>100</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>101</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>102</sup> [Letter, Minister for Home Affairs to CEHA Panel, 9th November 2022](#)

*This allocation is for additional staffing, which is necessary due to the increased demand on the OSIR since taking responsibility for Parish Registration.<sup>103</sup>*

Based on the information provided, the Panel is content with the rationale for this programme and the funding allocation.



#### FINDING 15

Discussions about the transitional arrangements relating to line management, facilities and processes, for the Office of the Superintendent Registrar (OSIR) are ongoing, and the OSIR will continue to operate with the support of Customer and Local Services until 31st December 2022. The additional £207,000 of funding from 2023 onwards will support additional staff at the OSIR for undertaking the registrations function. No funding has been allocated for software changes.

### I-JHA-GP23-002: Ambulance Service

Justice and Home Affairs

#### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023-2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
1,010	1,192	1,246	1,246

#### Overview

*This investment in our Ambulance Service is to ensure we meet current operational demands, to improve patient response, average waiting times for an emergency ambulance response, response times to emergency calls and minimise risk to Islanders. Also, this investment will ensure that our Ambulance Service has a suitable governance structure to comply with current standards and legal requirements and deliver Health and Safety requirements.*

[...]

*The investment also aims to address a deficit in the current staff and non-staff budgets, along with cost pressures as a result of increasing operating costs.<sup>104</sup>*

#### Panel analysis

The Annex to the Government Plan states that this programme of investment in the States of Jersey Ambulance Service (SoJAS) is in response to a significant increase in demand for SoJAS services.<sup>105</sup>

<sup>103</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>104</sup> [Annex](#) to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 65-66

<sup>105</sup> [Ibid](#)

The Panel notes that the investment should increase the number of SoJAS staff to improve emergency responsiveness, staff investment to ensure compliance and improvements in governance standards and health and safety requirements. The Panel also notes that the investment will include provision of training, uniform, specialist equipment and maintenance of the SoJAS Station to maintain infection control standards:

*We will fund an increase in operational emergency staff resources and provide governance and support roles associated with meeting and improving governance standards, and ultimately compliance with health and safety requirements. We will fund the necessary training, uniform and specialist equipment associated with these roles.*

*Funding is also allocated towards the maintenance of the Ambulance Station in order to meet modern infection control standards.<sup>106</sup>*

The Panel considered the Government Plan investment in the SoJAS in relation to the Independent Review of the States of Jersey Ambulance Service (Review), published by the Association of Ambulance Chief Executives (AACE) in April 2022. The Review followed an inspection of the SoJAS by AACE and used a similar inspection process to that of the UK Care Quality Commission.<sup>107</sup>

The Panel is pleased that the Review found, overall, the SoJAS provides a safe and quality service to patients in Jersey:

*The overall findings from the review confirm that SoJAS is a good service, with passionate caring staff providing, generally, a good quality, safe service for patients.<sup>108</sup>*

However, the Panel also noted a number of concerns from the Review that related to inadequate funding of the SoJAS, which included staff capacity and the use of agency staff and overtime, as well historic transitional issues related to the transfer of budgets from Health and Community Services (HCS) to JHA:

*The service is currently inadequately funded due to a combination of issues including a lack of core capacity leading to a necessity to use more agency staff and overtime and some historic transitional issues as budgets were transferred from HCS to JHA leading to a shortfall in the funding transferred.<sup>109</sup>*

In written correspondence to the Minister the Panel decided to ask for more information about the proposed SoJAS staffing data set out in the Government Plan. The Minister set out that the Government Plan investment included an additional 13 frontline staff compared with Government Plan 2022-2025 and that the Government Plan data reflected a transfer of 17 SoJAS Control Room staff to the JHA Directorate from the SoJAS:

---

<sup>106</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>107</sup> [AACE Independent Review of the States of Jersey Ambulance Service](#)

<sup>108</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>109</sup> [Ibid](#)

**Letter – Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel to Minister for Home Affairs – 2nd November 2022:**

*The Panel has compared the number of FTE staff estimated for 2023 in the previous Government Plan to the proposed Government Plan and notes that the FTE for the States of Jersey Ambulance Service (SoJAS) has reduced from 82 to 78. Please can you provide the rationale for the apparent reduction in SoJAS overall FTE staffing levels projected for 2023 in Government Plan 2023-2026?*

**Letter – Minister for Home Affairs to Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel – 9th November 2022:**

*The difference is due to the transfer of 17 Control Room staff to the JHA Directorate and out of Ambulance. The investment in the 2023 Government Plan provides for an increase in FTE of frontline staff for Ambulance, as below:*

*Government Plan 2022: 82*

*GP23 investment: 13*

*Transfer of CCR to JHA Directorate: (17)*

*Government Plan 2023: 78<sup>110</sup>*

During the Government Plan 2023-2026 Public Review Hearing with the Minister on 11th November 2022, the Panel questioned how the funding would address the concerns raised by the Review. The Panel learned that in addition to staffing and equipment issues, the funding would be used to address governance issues within the SoJAS:

**Deputy Catherine Curtis, Chair:**

*To what extent does the Government Plan investment in the ambulance service address the concerns raised in the recently released independent review?*

**Deputy Helen Miles, Minister for Home Affairs:**

*As well as the staff issues and the equipment issues, also part of that money is going to go to some of the governance issues. We need to have a suitable governance structure to make sure that we are compliant with current standards and legal requirements. The money will be spread across those functions. I think you will notice from the Government Plan that the ambulance service has been given almost double the funding that the fire service has, so we have prioritised the significant needs of the ambulance over the fire service on this occasion.<sup>111</sup>*

The Panel further questioned Government Plan funding in SoJAS staffing and asked how this would reduce the need for overtime from existing staff, the use of agency staff and reliance on SoJAS managers to respond to emergency calls. The Minister confirmed that the SoJAS

---

<sup>110</sup> [Letter, Minister for Home Affairs, 9th November 2022](#)

<sup>111</sup> [Transcript, Government Plan 2023-2026 Public Review Hearing with the Minister for Home Affairs, 11th November 2022](#)

does have a reliance on agency staff, and that the Government Plan funding will enable the SoJAS to recruit to fully resource the SoJAS and improve staff working conditions:

**Deputy Catherine Curtis, Chair:**

*The supplementary question I had you have answered in a way, but just to confirm then the Government Plan investment should reduce the need for additional overtime from core staff and the use of agency staff and the reliance on managers to attend calls?*

**Deputy Helen Miles, Minister for Home Affairs:**

*...Staff need to be given proper breaks and they need not to be working overtime. We have had a reliance on agency, but this funding will allow us to recruit up to the full numbers and provide terms and...well, we provide good terms but better working conditions for staff in the longer run.*

The Panel note that the Review highlighted that SoJAS had never undertaken a formal and independent Demand and Capacity Review (DCR) to determine the resources and skills needed to meet current and future demand, and that a DCR was urgently required to for the SoJAS to understand its capacity and funding requirements to inform planning processes:

*The service has never conducted a formal, independent demand and capacity review (DCR) across all its operational functions to determine the required resourcing and skill mix needed to meet its current and future demand. This is routine practice within the UK ambulance services and is now urgently required if the service is to understand its capacity and funding requirements to reliably inform planning processes.<sup>112</sup>*

The Panel asked about capacity issues within the SoJAS during a Quarterly Public Hearing with the Minister on 11th November 2022 and learned that the SoJAS had commenced a DCR which would deliver improvements to the SoJAS, and was due to be completed by the end of 2022:

**The Connétable of Grouville:**

*The next question is about the ambulance response programme. Has the introduction of this programme helped the service with capacity issues?*

**The Minister for Home Affairs:**

*The ambulance response programme has helped somewhat but it is the demand and capacity review that will deliver the real improvements when we have a full understanding of, as it says on the tin, demand and capacity. We are expecting that at the end of this year so it is something that I will be interested to update you at our next quarterly hearing.<sup>113</sup>*

---

<sup>112</sup> [AACE Independent Review of the States of Jersey Ambulance Service](#)

<sup>113</sup> [Transcript, Quarterly Public Hearing with the Minister for Home Affairs, 11th November 2022](#)

Based on the information provided, the Panel is content with the rationale for this programme and the funding allocation.

#### FINDING 16



The Government Plan 2023-2026 funding allocated to the States of Jersey Ambulance Service addresses staffing, equipment and governance concerns raised by the will make provision for 13 additional full time equivalent frontline staff.

#### FINDING 17



The States of Jersey Ambulance Service commenced a formal Demand and Capacity Review which is due to complete by the end of 2022.

### I-JHA-GP23-003: Fire and Rescue Service

#### Justice and Home Affairs

#### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023-2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
495	930	1,238	1,238

#### Overview

*“Over a number of years, the professional standards for how Fire and Rescue Services teams and firefighters prevent fires and other emergencies, protect people in higher risk settings and respond, safely and effectively to emergencies have expanded, changed and advanced; particularly in the ‘post Grenfell’ context.”<sup>114</sup>*

#### Panel analysis

The Panel understands that the changes to the professional standards used by Fire and Rescue Service Teams following the Grenfell Tower disaster in London in 2017, has established new benchmarks for fire and rescue authorities:

*“These standards have become the benchmark by which fire and rescue authorities and services are assessed and they are used in demonstrating compliance with health and safety legislation.”<sup>115</sup>*

The Panel note that the Government Plan 2023-2026 funding allocated to this project is designed to improve public and firefighter safety in the short to medium term, increase the number of firefighters at various ranks and roles, an increase in training and protective clothing and equipment to respond to high-rise incidents and implement learning and training from National Operational Guidance:

<sup>114</sup> [Annex](#) to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 66

<sup>115</sup> [Ibid](#)

*“This investment will enable real improvement in public and firefighter safety in the short to medium term and will provide the foundations for longer term strategic work to address the complex and evolving risk environment.*

*This investment will fund an increase in the number of firefighters, at various ranks and in various roles with an associated increase in training and protective clothing and equipment provision in order to improve response to high-rise incidents and implement National Operational Guidance, learning and training.”<sup>116</sup>*

During a Government Plan 2023-2026 Review Public Hearing on 11th November 2022, the Panel decided to question the Minister about whether the allocation of funding to the States of Jersey Fire and Rescue Service (SoJFRS) would increase the numbers and types of firefighters. The Panel learned that the funding would increase the number of full-time firefighters with budget available to also increase the number of retained and on-call firefighters:

**Deputy B. Porée:**

*“This obviously follows the fire and rescue services. Does the Government Plan investment to fund and increase the number of firefighters make specific provision to increase the number of all kinds of firefighters?”*

**The Minister for Home Affairs:**

*“Yes. What the funding will do is increase the number of full-time firefighters but also some money in the budget to try to increase our number of retained firefighters, on-call firefighters, because we need to have the capacity within the service to provide a response to emergencies.”<sup>117</sup>*

The Panel then asked about how the funding allocated to this Government Plan project would address issues related to training and maintaining the competence of on-call firefighters. The Panel learned that the funding allocated to the project would enable the SoJFRS to offer more training to firefighter recruits and that a recruitment campaign for firefighting recruits would take place in 2023:

**The Connétable of Grouville:**

*“Another question on fire and rescue. How does the funding allocated in the Government Plan address the limitations associated with on-call firefighters with their availability, such as difficulties with training and maintaining competence?”*

**The Minister for Home Affairs:**

*“What it does is make sure that we can offer more training to the recruits that we have and we are also going to be mounting a recruitment campaign in the new year.”<sup>118</sup>*

In addition, the Panel learned that the Minister believed the Government Plan 2023-2026 investment, addressed most of the key risks for the SoJFRS recorded in the Government's

---

<sup>116</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>117</sup> [Transcript, Government Plan 2023-2026 Review Public Hearing with the Minister for Home Affairs, 11th November 2022](#)

<sup>118</sup> [Ibid](#)

Corporate Risk Register related to public and firefighter safety in operational service delivery, during a Quarterly Public Hearing on 11th November 2022:

**Deputy Catherine Curtis, Chair:**

*“Could you confirm what work you have done to review the fire and rescue sections on the Justice and Home Affairs risk register?”*

**The Minister for Home Affairs:**

*“The nature of the risks for the Fire and Rescue Service are recorded in the Government corporate risk register, and the risk is that they are all associated with statutory duties and relate to public and firefighter safety in operational service delivery...”*

*“...The chief fire officer keeps the risks under constant review. He obviously reviews the risks outside the standard meeting times. But most of the key risks have been addressed now by the investment that has been proposed in the Government Plan.”<sup>119</sup>*

The Panel then asked about the areas classed by the SoJFRS as an extreme level of risk, the Panel learned that two key risks related to resourcing and succession planning as highlighted by the Independent Bespoke Peer Challenge of the SoJFRS, and the ability of the SoJFRS to deal with fire in high-rise residential buildings:

**Deputy Catherine Curtis, Chair:**

*“What are the areas classed as extreme risk level?”*

**Directors General, Justice and Home Affairs:**

*“There are 2 key ones, both of which are addressed in the Government Plan business case. The first is around resourcing and succession planning, which is covered in a number of points in the peer review. The second is really around the concerns about the current capacity to deal appropriately with a high-rise residential building fire.”<sup>120</sup>*

The Panel also wrote to the Jersey Fire and Rescue Service Association (Association) as part of its stakeholder engagement process and asked the Association for its comments and views about this Government Plan 2023-2026 project. The Panel learned that the Association had been concerned for several years about the *“efficiency and rebalancing measures of previous Government Plans and savings initiatives”* and highlighted that staff costs reduced the spending capacity of the non-staff allocation available to the States of Jersey Fire and Rescue Service (SoJFRS). There was a concern that, if further savings could not be found in non-staff costs, the staff costs might be impacted. The Association highlighted that protection of both budgets was essential:

*“Staff costs equate to almost 90% of the Service budget, leaving the remaining non-staff allocation to provide predominantly for fleet & equipment, personal protective equipment and training. These non-staff costs are critical to the effective functioning of an emergency response and also to the statutory fire prevention and protection*

---

<sup>119</sup> [Transcript, Quarterly Public Hearing with the Minister for Home Affairs, 11th November 2022](#)

<sup>120</sup> [Ibid](#)

*elements of the Service. To continue in this vein will only leave Jersey with a reduced and less effective frontline emergency service.”<sup>121</sup>*

The Panel note that the Association welcomes the proposed funding allocated to the SoJFRS in the Government Plan 2023-2026, and that this will contribute to the protection of the public and firefighters from the range of risks faced by the Island:

*“Therefore, the proposals included in this Government Plan to support the Service’s need for increased investment and resources is a significant step in the right direction to protect both the public and firefighters from the wide range of risks the Island faces. We are encouraged by the Plan and the Minister’s forthright approach to ensuring frontline services are appropriately funded.”<sup>122</sup>*

Based on the information provided, the Panel is content with the rationale for this programme and the funding allocation.

#### FINDING 18



The funding allocated to the States of Jersey Fire and Rescue Service as part of the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026 will fund firefighter training and, also, an increase in the number of firefighters (at various levels and ranks), with a recruitment campaign to start in early 2023.

#### FINDING 19



Staff costs historically reduced the spending capacity of the non-staff allocation available to the States of Jersey Fire and Rescue Service.

### I-JHA-GP23-004: Combined Control Room

#### Justice and Home Affairs

#### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023-2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
703	859	447	415

#### Overview

*The Ambulance, Fire & Rescue and Police control rooms have been co-located since 2019 and this has increased operational co-operation between the services<sup>123</sup>.*

#### Panel analysis

<sup>121</sup> [Written submission – Letter from the Jersey Fire and Rescue Service Association](#)

<sup>122</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>123</sup> [‘Annex’](#) to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 66

The Panel note that the co-location of Jersey’s frontline emergency services control rooms requires ‘*Major improvements*’ to deliver ‘*speedy, accurate, resilient and compliant control room services to both the public of Jersey and the emergency services*’.<sup>124</sup>

The Panel also noted that the allocation of funding is intended to deliver ‘planned improvements’<sup>125</sup> and decided to ask for more information about the planned improvements in the Government Plan 2023-2026 Public Review Hearing on 11th November 2022. The Panel found that the focus of the project was on training for staff working in the new Combined Control Room and that the management structure of the Combined Control Room was guided by a new Service Level Agreement:

**Deputy Catherine Curtis, Chair:**

*Please can you describe how planned improvements to the combined control room differ from the changes that were made in 2018 to establish the combined control room for the ambulance service, fire service and police?*

**The Minister for Home Affairs:**

*The money is really to fund better training and more integrated training for the staff that are already there.*

**Directors General, Justice and Home Affairs:**

*So, as the Minister has said, the real focus of this investment, if approved, is revenue in people, so a bit more programmed on project management to lead us through the change and really investing in the management structure and the people and the training so that it is as resilient and effective as it can be. That is underpinned by a new service level agreement that we have just agreed with Robin and his head of service colleagues for ambulance and fire and rescue and that will be our guiding document...<sup>126</sup>*

Based on the information provided, the Panel is content with the rationale for this programme and the funding allocation.



**FINDING 20**

The funding allocated to the Combined Control Room will be used to fund staff training and implement a management structure that will be guided by a new Service Level Agreement.

**I-JHA-GP23-005: Brexit – Increased Activity and Border Compliance**

Justice and Home Affairs

**Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023-2026 (£000):**

2023	2024	2025	2026
155	208	208	208

<sup>124</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>125</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>126</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Home Affairs, 11th November 2022](#)

## Overview

*Jersey has a legal obligation to comply with the requirements of both the UK/Crown Dependencies Customs Union and the Common Travel Area as a result of the UK's decision to leave the EU.<sup>127</sup>*

## Panel analysis

The outbreak of COVID-19 in Jersey in March 2020 resulted in a number of restrictions, that impacted on travel to and from the Island.<sup>128</sup> However, the Panel noted that a return to pre-pandemic levels of travel to and from Jersey and the increased controls on goods and people as a result of Brexit, has impacted workloads at Jersey's borders:

*Covid-19 masked the impacts of this due to reduced travel but as activity returns to pre-pandemic levels the effects of increased controls on both goods and people are resulting in significant increased workloads at the Island's borders.<sup>129</sup>*

The Panel also noted that this project was intended to allocate funding to employ three Customs and Immigration Officers to resource Jersey's border compliance and manage the impact of Brexit in line with the UK and Europe:

*This investment is intended to fund the employment of three Customs and Immigration Officers to ensure adequate resources at Jersey's borders. The UK and Europe have increased border officers to cope with the demands of Brexit but so far Jersey is yet to do so.<sup>130</sup>*

The Panel decided to request data about the increased levels of border activity that followed the UK's withdrawal from the European Union (EU). The Panel was provided with data in written correspondence from the Minister on 22nd November 2022, that indicated that the numbers of work permits issued between 2020 and 2021 increased by 884 and numbers of visas issued between 2020 and 2021 increased by 615.<sup>131</sup>

The Panel learned that the immigration scrutiny of European nationals had increased significantly following the UK's withdrawal from the EU that resulted in the end of freedom of movement:

*In addition, scrutiny on European nationals has increased significantly as free movement has ended post Brexit. This has led and will lead to further increases in numbers of those refused entry on arrival.<sup>132</sup>*

Based on the information provided, the Panel is content with the rationale for this programme and the funding allocation.

---

<sup>127</sup> ['Annex'](#) to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 66

<sup>128</sup> [Government of Jersey – 'Stay Home' to slow the spread of Coronavirus](#)

<sup>129</sup> ['Annex'](#) to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 66

<sup>130</sup> [Ibid](#), p.67

<sup>131</sup> [Letter, Minister for Home Affairs to CEHA Panel, 22nd November 2022](#)

<sup>132</sup> [Ibid](#)

## I-JHA-GP23-006: Governance and Performance

### Justice and Home Affairs

#### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023-2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
155	155	155	155

#### Overview

*The funding is to ensure that there is an increase in Emergency Planning resourcing...*<sup>133</sup>

#### Panel analysis

The Panel understands that the funding allocated to this project as an additional revenue programme in Government Plan 2023-2026, is to make provision for an Assistant Emergency Planning Officer to continue to develop and oversee the Community Risk Register and new Civil Contingencies Legislation and focus on wider resilience:

*...adding an Assistant Emergency Planning Officer, in order to continue the development and oversight of the Community Risk Register, and the development and implementation of new Civil Contingencies Legislation, with a focus on wider resilience.*<sup>134</sup>

It will also provide funding to secure regular inspections of the States of Jersey Fire & Rescue Service, the States of Jersey Prison Service and Jersey Customs and Immigration Service.<sup>135</sup>

In a letter to the Minister on 2nd November 2022, the Panel asked where the Governance and Performance project was allocated within the service level analysis for JHA set out in the Annex to the Government Plan 2023-2026<sup>136</sup> and learned that this project fell within the 'Inspection Costs – JHA Directorate' and 'Assistant Emergency Planning Officer – Emergency Planning, which is in the Fire & Rescue budget'.<sup>137</sup>

Based on the information provided, the Panel is content with the rationale for this programme and the funding allocation.

<sup>133</sup> [Annex](#) to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 67

<sup>134</sup> [Annex](#) to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 67

<sup>135</sup> [Annex](#) to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 67

<sup>136</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>137</sup> [Letter, Minister for Home Affairs, 22nd November 2022](#)

## I-JHA-GP23-007: Jersey Care Commission – Regulation Management

### Justice and Home Affairs

#### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023-2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
114	168	168	168

#### Overview

*The regulatory remit of the Care Commission is expected to be extended to the Ambulance Service.<sup>138</sup>*

#### Panel analysis

The Panel understands that the allocation of funding to the Jersey Care Commission – Regulation Management project is intended to prepare the States of Jersey Ambulance Service (SoJAS) for regulatory activities expected to commence in 2024, and that the Government Plan investment will fund staff posts to facilitate this work:

*This investment is intended to fund the Ambulance Service’s preparation through 2023 for the expected regulatory activities beginning in 2024. Funding is centred on two posts aimed at ensuring the Service is able to continually demonstrate compliance with regulatory requirements.<sup>139</sup>*

The Panel note that this project will facilitate the process of identifying, gathering information and presenting data and findings:

*This includes identifying and gathering the information and data necessary to register with the Jersey Care Commission, and to present to the Commission to support its inspections.<sup>140</sup>*

During its review of Government Plan 2023-2026, the Panel decided to request information about the specific roles in a letter to the Minister dated 14th November 2022, and learned that these included a Grade 12 Data Analyst and a Grade 12 Regulation and Inspection Lead:

*Please could you confirm the specific roles and grades of those posts?*

<sup>141</sup>

Title	Grade	FTE
Data Analyst	CS124	1
Regulation and Inspection Lead	CS124	1

Based on the information provided, the Panel is content with the rationale for this programme and the funding allocation.

<sup>138</sup> [‘Annex’](#) to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 67

<sup>139</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>140</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>141</sup> [Letter, Minister for Home Affairs to CEHA Panel, 22nd November 2022](#)

## I-JHA-GP23-008: TETRA Extension

### Justice and Home Affairs

#### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023-2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
-	250	250	250

#### Overview

*The current critical, secure communications system for emergency services and partner resilience organisations, based upon TETRA technology, is at the end of its intended operational life.<sup>142</sup>*

#### Panel analysis

Terrestrial Trunked Radio (TETRA) technology was due to be replaced, but this replacement was delayed due to Jersey's reliance on the UK Government replacing its use of similar technology with the Emergency Services Network (ESN):

*This investment acknowledges the significant delays experienced by the ESN...<sup>143</sup>*

The Panel noted during its review of the Government Plan that the funds allocated to this project would be used to extend and replace the current TETRA system. The extension of TETRA includes the refresh of radios, upgrades to system hardware and project management of the extend and replace strategy:

*This investment will provide the funds required to refresh radios, upgrade some small elements of system hardware and procure project management to both upgrade the existing system as well as commence the delayed 'replace' element.<sup>144</sup>*

The Panel noted £750k of additional revenue allocated to extend the TETRA system to 2026 and an annual increase in funding of £45k per annum (2024-2026) allocated to the TETRA Extension project, compared with the funds allocated to the TETRA Service User Agreement project in Government Plan 2022-2025.<sup>145</sup>

In written correspondence to the Minister on 2nd November 2022, the Panel decided to ask for more information about the funding allocated to this project. The Panel learned that £500,000 would be allocated to refresh vehicle mobile, handheld radio and ancillary equipment as well as engineering works estimated to cost £250k. The Panel also learned that the increase in cost of £45k per annum reflected the cost of the Service User Agreement with Motorola which had not previously been included in the JHA base budget:

*This will require a refresh of subscriber (vehicle mobile and handheld radio units and ancillary equipment); this will cost around £500,000. Further costs to refresh IT hardware (the 'control' element of the system) as well as some engineering works will also be required and, at this stage, are estimated to cost around £250,000.*

<sup>142</sup> ['Annex'](#) to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 67

<sup>143</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>144</sup> [Letter, CEHA Panel to Minister for Home Affairs, 2nd November 2022](#)

<sup>145</sup> [Government Plan 2022-2025](#)

*The £45,000 increase was in respect of the Service User Agreement for Motorola, which had not previously been included in JHA base budget.<sup>146</sup>*

The Panel also decided to ask when the Minister expected to complete the ‘extend and replace strategy’ and replace the TETRA system. The Panel was informed that the ‘extend’ element of the TETRA ‘extend and replace strategy’ would include the years 2029 and possibly 2030:

*In assuming a 2029 or 2030 timetable, contingency is allowed for slippage in the ESN rollout, for the UK experience to be considered and also for optimised value for money from the immediate and necessary ‘extend’ element to be achieved.<sup>147</sup>*

Based on the information provided, the Panel is content with the rationale for this programme and the funding allocation.



#### **FINDING 21**

The timetable for the ‘extend and replace strategy’ of the TETRA Extension project is likely to continue through to 2029 and 2030.

---

<sup>146</sup> [Letter , CEHA Panel to Minister for Home Affairs, 2nd November 2022](#)

<sup>147</sup> [Ibid](#)

### Programmes within States of Jersey Police

<b>I-SoJP-GP23-001: Police Resourcing</b>
<b>States of Jersey Police</b>

#### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023-2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
500	500	500	500

#### Overview

The Annex advises that *'This investment is to ensure the States of Jersey Police can maintain adequate Officer/Staff headcount whilst also ensuring and maintaining core service delivery'*.<sup>148</sup>

#### Panel analysis

The establishment number of 215 officers (and 125 support staff) for the States of Jersey Police was a figure agreed by the States Assembly.

The Panel was provided with an overview of this proposed revenue funding by the Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police, who explained that the £500,000 of additional revenue funding would bring the SoJP budget up to a level where it would employ 215 police officers:

#### **Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:**

*So back in 2019 it was agreed that the establishment for police officers would be 215. We discovered at the beginning of this year that the funding was still not quite there to deliver the 215 so we submitted a business case to the Government, supported significantly by the Minister and the Director General for J.H.A. (Justice and Home Affairs), and we have been allocated an additional £500,000 to deliver the 215. I am very confident that we will deliver the 215 this year.*<sup>149</sup>

The Panel also heard that the officer numbers were made up of 12 new recruits and seven 'transferees' from other Police forces.<sup>150</sup>

A written submission was sent to the Panel from the Jersey Police Authority (JPA) which referenced the impact of previous efficiency programmes on the SoJP's ability to employ the approved levels of staff:

*... due to repeated 'efficiencies' being placed on the organisation, (in excess of £2m in the last two years alone), it has been impossible to maintain this number, requiring staff vacancies to be kept open. The JPA has been clear that we expect a fully established workforce moving into 2023 and while we fully support SOJP contributing to efforts to address public financing pressures, this cannot be at the expense of having*

<sup>148</sup> ['Annex'](#) to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 68

<sup>149</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Home Affairs: Government Plan Review, 11<sup>th</sup> November, p.8](#)

<sup>150</sup> [Ibid](#)

*sufficient numbers of police and support staff to deliver what the public in Jersey deserve and expect.*<sup>151</sup>

The JPA also advised the Panel that they were ‘currently satisfied that this is sufficient, but would strongly resist any further budget cuts’.<sup>152</sup>

Based on the information provided, the Panel is content with the rationale for this programme.

### FINDING 22



The States Assembly has agreed that the States of Jersey Police has an agreed establishment number of 215 police officers, however, due to previous efficiencies this target has not been met. The additional revenue funding of £500,000 per annum for each year of this Government Plan will support the employment of more police officers to bring the force up to the requirements.

## I-SoJP-GP23-002: Victim Support

### States of Jersey Police

#### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023-2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
325	325	325	325

#### Overview

The Annex notes that some victim support services were originally funded from the Building a Safer Society strategy, it also explains that:

*This investment is intended to provide a longer-term funding model and to ensure there is a professional, co-ordinated service that is accessible to all victims of crime. In addition, this investment will complement and build on the investment already made by the Government into sexual and domestic abuse services. The funding will be spent on 5 FTEs as well as their training/CPD costs.*<sup>153</sup>

#### Panel analysis

The Panel asked for some information and data about the demand on victim support services. The Minister for Home Affairs provided a ‘snapshot’ of activity and outcomes delivered by Victims First Jersey from March 2021 to March 2022:

- 1910 Rapid Needs Assessments completed with the victim within 48 hours of them reporting a crime and identified practical and emotional support provided.
- Provision of support to victims and witnesses at 38 Royal Court Trials and 26 Magistrate Court Trials (including Youth Trials).
- 253 Victims received specialist support in relation to their safety.

<sup>151</sup> [Written submission, Jersey Police Authority](#)

<sup>152</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>153</sup> [‘Annex’](#) to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 68

- *42 Victims have opted to receive specialist support in relation to the Victim Notification Scheme.*
- *835 victims provided feedback in a survey about their experience through the criminal justice system which informs and drives improvement in performance for the police service and Law Officers Department.*<sup>154</sup>

It was clarified that the 5 FTE (full time equivalent) roles would not be new recruits, these would be used to create permanent roles for 5 Victim Advocates who were employed on full time contracts (for the duration of a pilot scheme which ends on 31<sup>st</sup> December 2022)<sup>155</sup>.

In a letter to the Panel, the Minister also advised that there was funding in the Government's business case for a Team Leader. If this funding was approved in the Government Plan, the recruitment process would begin.

In a submission from the JPA, the Panel was advised that:

*The JPA is supportive of this vital investment as it will assist the police in providing a more streamlined service to witnesses and victims whose trust and confidence in the criminal justice system is vital to enable police and prosecutors to fulfil their role of investigating crimes and prosecuting criminals.*<sup>156</sup>

Based on the information provided, the Panel is content with the rationale for this programme.



#### FINDING 23

The additional revenue programme for 'Victim Support' will provide longer term investment funding into the services provided to victims of crime.

### I-SoJP-GP23-003: Associated Costs of Domestic Abuse Law

#### States of Jersey Police

#### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023-2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
200	200	200	200

#### Overview

The Domestic Abuse Law 2022 '*provides for notification requirements and domestic abuse orders, which prevent/restrict an offender from certain actions such as coming within a specified distance of the victim. It also allows the Police to disclose certain information about an offender to protect a relevant person.*'<sup>157</sup>

The Annex to the Government Plan explained that '*The introduction of this law [Domestic Abuse (Jersey) Law 2022] has put additional demand on services. This investment is intended*

<sup>154</sup> [Letter, Minister for Home Affairs, 22<sup>nd</sup> November 2022](#)

<sup>155</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>156</sup> [Written submission, Jersey Police Authority](#)

<sup>157</sup> '[Annex](#)' to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 68

*to fund the cost of recruiting 3 FTEs and one-off costs including training and IT equipment for the purpose of implementing the law’.*<sup>158</sup>

### **Panel analysis**

The Panel wrote to the Minister for Home Affairs to ask for some further information about the additional demand on services following the development of the Domestic Abuse (Jersey) Law 2022. The Minister advised that:

*Currently, there is no additional demand as the law has not come into force. The need for additional resources was identified due to no arrangements being in place to manage domestic abuse offenders effectively. Currently, a proportion of offenders will be subject to a probation order, however, many serve a short sentence and are released without conditions or post custodial supervision requirements. Historically, the problem surrounds a lack of legal management mechanisms associated with convicted domestic abuse reoffenders. This results in a cycle of offending which has substantial social and economic costs.*

The Panel also asked the Minister to provide some further details about the 3 FTE roles required as a result of the adoption of the Law. It was confirmed that the roles are required to supervise and manage the offenders once in the community. The Panel understands that the number of FTE has been based on annual conviction rates. The post holders will also be expected to work in partnership with other agencies and contribute to the Multi Agency Public Protection Arrangements.

The Panel received a submission from the JPA which confirmed its support for this additional funding:

*The JPA is fully supportive of this funding as this will allow for additional resources to be used as Offender Managers (OM). OM’s provide for the supervision and management of offenders in the community.*

In a submission to the Panel from JAAR, it was suggested that there was insufficient detail to check how demand would be reviewed:

*... there is no clarity in the documentation on what these additional demands are and how these fit with other areas of growth in victim support, grants to agencies or whether it is for further policy work. Therefore, the question is, where is the demand and who will be responsible for ensuring demands are met.*<sup>159</sup>

Based on the information provided, the Panel is content with the rationale for this programme.

---

<sup>158</sup> [‘Annex’](#) to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 69

<sup>159</sup> [Written submission, Jersey Action Against Rape](#)

### Programmes within Non-Ministerial Departments

<b>I-PROB-GP23-001: Probation Officer</b>
<b>Non-Ministerial</b>

#### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023-2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
77	154	154	154

#### Overview

In the planned legislative programme for 2023, the Minister for Home Affairs has listed Prison (Amendment No.8) (Jersey) Law 202- which will create a system of post-custodial supervision for people leaving prison. The Annex explains that this *'will result in all prisoners sentenced to six months (or more) imprisonment having to report to the Probation Service upon release until the end of their sentence.'*<sup>160</sup>

The funding requested in the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026 *'is intended to fund the recruitment of one additional Probation Officer in 2023 and a further officer in 2024 to undertake new work that will be created by the proposed introduction of statutory post custodial supervision in Jersey.'*<sup>161</sup> Also, in addition to post-custodial supervision work the investment will also support the Probation Service's response to the forthcoming Domestic Abuse Law<sup>162</sup>.

#### Panel analysis

The Panel wrote to the Chief Probation Officer to request some further details about this funding. The response can be read in full [here](#).

The proposed introduction of post custodial supervision and, also, the forthcoming Domestic Abuse (Jersey) Law 2022 will result in additional responsibilities for the Probation Service and therefore additional Probation Officer capacity is required in order to support this function<sup>163</sup>.

Based on the information provided, the Panel is content with the rationale for this programme and is supportive of the additional funding.

<sup>160</sup> [Annex](#) to the Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026, p. 79

<sup>161</sup> [Ibid](#), p.80

<sup>162</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>163</sup> [Written submission, Jersey Probation and After-Care Service](#)

## 7 Value for Money Savings

### Overview

The Council of Ministers plans to establish a Value for Money (VFM) programme over the next 4 years.

The Government Plan proposes £10 million of VFM savings in 2023, with the intent that a further £30 million of savings will be delivered across 2024 to 2026. The table below shows the VFM totals for 2023 considered by the Panel in this report:

	<b>2023 Estimate (£000)</b>
Children, Young People, Education and Skills	688
Justice and Home Affairs	144
States of Jersey Police	117
Reserve for Centrally Held Items	7,140

The Government Plan indicates that ‘cashable efficiency targets have been allocated to Departments as part of the Departmental Revenue Budgets<sup>165</sup> and that the non-pay inflation saving is shown in the Reserve for Centrally Held Items<sup>166</sup>.

The Panel references the overarching recommendations made by the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel in relation to the Value for Money Programme (see Appendix 2, overarching recommendations numbered 18, 19 and 20 for further information).

### **Panel analysis**

#### **Children, Young People, Education and Skills**

In a letter to the Minister for Children and Education on 8<sup>th</sup> November 2022 the Panel asked for a more detailed breakdown of where CYPES would find the £688,000 of value for money savings in 2023. We were advised that ‘*A plan to deliver £688k is being developed and further details can be shared with the Panel as it progresses.*’<sup>167</sup>

The Panel had noted that the previous Government Plan had identified £460,000 of efficiencies for the Minister for Children and Education in 2022. We asked the Minister what

<sup>164</sup> [‘Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026’](#), Table 16, p.47

<sup>165</sup> Ibid, p. 46

<sup>166</sup> Ibid, p. 46 - 47

<sup>167</sup> Letter, Minister for Children and Education, 8<sup>th</sup> November 2022

efficiencies have been made to date and were advised that: *'In 2022 the only recurring efficiency made relates to the restructuring of a business support function releasing £73k.'*<sup>168</sup>

The Panel noted that the 2023 CYPES value for money target (of £688,000) is more than the efficiencies identified in 2022 for the Ministerial portfolio (£460,000). The Panel asked if the 2023 target was realistic and was advised that *'It is realistic non-recurrently. It will be a challenge to make recurring savings to meet the total target.'*<sup>169</sup>

The Panel has not been able to ascertain where the target figure of £688,000 VFM savings has originated, or where the savings will likely be found.

However, the Panel did receive confirmation that the £688,000 would be incorporated into the Department's Head of Expenditure budget. The Panel asked for clarity about how it would be accounted for when the savings are yet to be identified. The Minister responded to say that: *'This is an unallocated savings target held centrally whilst a plan is being developed for its delivery.'*<sup>170</sup>

#### FINDING 24



The £688,000 of Value for Money Savings target for the Department of Children, Education, Young People and Skills has not been allocated.

### Justice and Home Affairs

The Panel asked the Minister for Home Affairs for a breakdown of the £144,000 VFM savings identified for the Justice and Home Affairs department. In a letter dated 9<sup>th</sup> November the Panel was advised that *'2023 savings will be offset using non-pay inflation in the first instance, in line with other Government departments. The services continue to seek efficiencies wherever possible, therefore non-pay inflation will be released as and when savings are identified.'*<sup>171</sup>

In a public hearing, the Panel requested further information about where the £144,000 would be found within the Department and were advised again that the savings would be offset by non-pay inflation:

**Director General, Justice and Home Affairs:**

*It is our understanding that although the non-pay inflation is held centrally, it will be released to departments.*<sup>172</sup>

For clarity, the Panel requested a definition of non-pay inflation and was advised that this related to purchases, for examples equipment, consumables and P.P.E. (personal protective equipment) for staff. It was explained that:

**Director General, Justice and Home Affairs:**

*... Pay inflation is very much the significant part of inflation pressure, particularly in the Department for Justice and Home Affairs of something like between 86 and 89 per cent pay. It is normally expected that we can consume the non-pay inflation. In the*

<sup>168</sup> [Letter, Minister for Children and Education, 8<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

<sup>169</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>170</sup> [Letter, Minister for Children and Education, 17<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

<sup>171</sup> [Letter, Minister for Home Affairs, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

<sup>172</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Home Affairs, 11<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p.14](#)

*current climate in the Government Plan it is recognised that that will be less achievable by departments because the non-pay inflation will be significantly more than it has been recently and therefore when we buy things we will be buying them at a greater cost and it will be more difficult to consume. So the intention is that unlike in previous years non-pay inflation will potentially be allocated to departments and we can offset that to ensure that we meet our value for money efficiency commitment here. What that means, though, is that we will still strive to achieve efficiencies in the department and if we can find £144,000 in efficiencies across the J.H.A. budget then we will. Particularly importantly if they are recurring we can bake those in for the future and we do not need to use the mechanism of offsetting the non-pay inflationary amount that would otherwise be allocated to the department.*<sup>173</sup>

The Panel was aware that the previous Government Plan identified £1.7 million of efficiencies to be found by the Minister for Home Affairs in 2022. The Panel asked for confirmation as to whether those efficiencies for 2022 had been made. In a written response from the Minister for Home Affairs, it was confirmed that ‘*The majority have been made. There is £255,000 remaining within JHA, which will be made in 2023.*’<sup>174</sup> The Panel asked for confirmation as to whether any of the 2022 efficiencies would overlap with the 2023 VFM saving targets and was advised that these were separate amounts.<sup>175</sup>

The Panel asked if the savings targets were realistic for 2023. The Director General advised that there was scope for efficiencies with non-pay costs, for example any cross over of consumables between the Health department and the Ambulance Service which could be explored further. It was confirmed that savings would be found from the non-pay areas and not the staff areas.<sup>176</sup>

#### FINDING 25



The £144,000 of Value for Money Savings target for the Department of Justice and Home Affairs has not been allocated.

#### States of Jersey Police

The Panel asked for a breakdown of the £117,000 that the States of Jersey Police had targeted as VFM Savings in 2023. The response provided to the Panel was identical to that received in respect of the Justice and Home Affairs Department, and advised that:

*2023 savings will be offset using non-pay inflation in the first instance, in line with other government departments. The service constantly seeks to find efficiencies wherever possible, therefore non-pay inflation will be released as and when savings are identified.*<sup>177</sup>

#### FINDING 26



The £117,000 of Value for Money Savings target for the States of Jersey Police has not been allocated.

<sup>173</sup> [Ibid, p.15](#)

<sup>174</sup> [Letter, Minister for Home Affairs, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

<sup>175</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Home Affairs, 11<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p. 16](#)

<sup>176</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>177</sup> [Letter, Minister for Home Affairs, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

## 8 Major projects

### Ambulance, Fire and Rescue Headquarters

Approval was provided in previous Government Plans for the replacement and combination of the service headquarters for both the States of Jersey Ambulance Service (SoJAS) and the States of Jersey Fire and Rescue Service (SoJFRS).

Sponsoring Department	Supporting Department	Previous Approval	Total Project Approval	Change
JHA	IHE	24,403	24,403	-

#### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023-2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
800	500	2,685	1,893

The Panel has undertaken site visits to the SoJAS Headquarters and SoJFRS Headquarters, both in St Helier, and has seen first-hand the challenges regarding the aging estate.

The Government Plan notes that the project to develop a new Headquarters has been delayed due to the wider estates review that is impacted by the decision about where a new town primary school (as replacement for Rouge Bouillon school) should be located. The Panel understands that the decision about the future location of the current Rouge Bouillon school will be confirmed by the Minister for Children and Education in early 2023.<sup>178</sup>

The Panel noted that the estimated costs for the duration of this Government Plan are lower than the total approved major project funding and asked the Minister for Home Affairs for a breakdown of the funding. We were advised that:

*This funding was based on the estimated cost of building a combined Ambulance, Fire and Rescue Headquarters on the current Fire and Rescue site at Rouge Bouillon, further to this emerging as the preferred location in the site selection feasibility study, which was completed in 2020.*

*This would have delivered a 5335m<sup>2</sup> station where both services could be co-located on a single site comprised of the current Fire and Rescue site and the former Police HQ site. The former Police HQ would have been demolished and the existing arsenal building, currently part of the Fire and Rescue site, was to be retained.*

*This project is on hold pending resolution of the site selection discussions between CYPES, JHA and Jersey Property Holdings, and then appropriate recommendations to Ministers. It is anticipated that the detail and funding will need to be reviewed and reconfigured once an appropriate solution is determined.<sup>179</sup>*

In a public hearing the Panel asked if any of the major project funding would be utilised for the maintenance of the current service headquarters:

<sup>178</sup> [Transcript, Quarterly Public Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education, 20<sup>th</sup> October 2022, p. 32](#)

<sup>179</sup> [Letter, Minister for Home Affairs, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

***The Connétable of Grouville:***

*... Is the funding assigned to the ambulance, fire and rescue headquarters project solely for the new headquarters building or is some of this funding now required for maintenance of the current buildings due to delay from the wider estate review?*

***The Minister for Home Affairs:***

*It is my understanding that the money that has been put into the allocation is for the ongoing work to deliver a new fire and ambulance headquarters. We will have to have a serious think about where the maintenance money is going to come from because, as we know, there are concerns about the physical standard of the building at the current ambulance headquarters.*

*This capital allocation is a capital allocation for the new build, which needs to remain there because obviously we continue to need to look forward to provide better accommodation and then we will have to look elsewhere for the maintenance.<sup>180</sup>*

The Panel is concerned to learn that the project to replace the Ambulance, Fire and Rescue Headquarters has been delayed and that no long term provision has been made for the continued maintenance of the ageing sites.

In a written submission to the Panel, the States of Jersey Fire and Rescue Service Association (the 'Association') highlighted that '*The decision to build a joint station was taken prior to expected growth in the services so a review of the longer term future for each would appear wise.*<sup>181</sup>

With regards to the decision on the location of the new Headquarters the Association states:

*Furthermore, the Fire and Rescue Service has determined that any of the identified alternative sites away from its current Rouge Bouillon location will, by nature of increased attendance times, put the high-risk populations of St. Helier at greater risk than they already are currently. Dependent on the site review outcome, any increase of the Rouge Bouillon school site into the current Fire & Rescue Service footprint will likely make locating a joint station on the remaining space more challenging.<sup>182</sup>*

**FINDING 27**

The major project to develop a new joint Ambulance, Fire and Rescue headquarters has been delayed because of a wider estate review and the previous States Assembly decision to review the current Fire and Rescue headquarters site for a new town primary school.

**RECOMMENDATION 9**

The Council of Ministers should identify funding for the maintenance of the current States of Jersey Ambulance Service building, as plans and location for replacement Headquarters are yet to be determined.

<sup>180</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Home Affairs, 11<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

<sup>181</sup> [Written submission, Jersey Fire and Rescue Service Association](#)

<sup>182</sup> [Ibid](#)

## School Estates

Sponsoring Department	Supporting Department	Previous Approval	Total Project Approval	Change
CYPES	IHE	31,350	-	(31,350)

The Government Plan explains in a footnote that ‘*Projects previously assigned to the School Estates Major Project are now provided for within the New School and Educational Developments Grouped Head of Expenditure*’.<sup>183</sup>

The reason given for this is that ‘*the Grouped Head of Expenditure enables funding to be reprioritised or for other priority projects to be accelerated*’.<sup>184</sup>

The Panel asked the Minister to clarify the list of projects that were comprised within the ‘Schools Estate’ major project which had £31.35 million approved in the previous Government Plan. It was confirmed that the projects were:

- VCP replacement school;
- Mont à l’Abbé Secondary School; and
- Redesign of Greenfields.<sup>185</sup>

The Panel also asked for confirmation if all of the above had moved to the ‘New School and Educational Developments’ Head of Expenditure. It was confirmed that the VCP replacement school and Mont à l’Abbé Secondary School had moved to the Grouped Head of Expenditure (GHOE), which also contained a number of other projects that were being explored (further details of the GHOE are in section 9 of this report). The Panel was advised that the ‘Redesign of Greenfields’ had been renamed ‘Residential Homes and Secure Settings’ under the ‘Upgrades to CYPES Estates Grouped Head of Expenditure’.<sup>186</sup>

The Panel received a submission from the Jersey Music Service which highlighted a concern about the approach of removing capital funding from assigned projects into Grouped Heads of Expenditure:

*The consolidation of CYPES capital funding into Grouped Headings could be a practical change that helps the Department manage project delays, shifting timescales etc., and therefore could prove to be a very sensible strategy. However, there is concern that the specific names of capital projects have been removed or changed. The placing of funding under one heading in order to get flexibility, should not necessitate the removing of named projects from the plan. With higher order outcomes changed the suspicion will be that the intention is to cancel some projects within the Grouped Heading without proper scrutiny, or reference to need. Therefore, it would be helpful if this change to the plan included some reference to the capital projects to be delivered under the Grouped Heading alongside an appropriate framework for scrutiny of the delivery of named projects by the States Members.*<sup>187</sup>

<sup>183</sup> [‘Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026’](#), p.65

<sup>184</sup> [Ibid](#), p.57

<sup>185</sup> [Letter, from the Minister for Children and Education, 8<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

<sup>186</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>187</sup> [Written submission, Jersey Music Service](#)

**FINDING 28**

£31.35 million has been removed from the approved capital expenditure for 'Schools Estates'. The projects which had been approved have been moved into new Grouped Heads of Expenditure to help CYPES manage and prioritise the estates projects.

**RECOMMENDATION 10**

The Minister for Children and Education should ensure that future Government Plans provide transparent breakdowns of planned estates projects within Grouped Heads of Expenditure.

## 9 Estates

---

### Land Acquisition

**No funding has been allocated to this Head of Expenditure, which sits under the remit of Infrastructure, Housing and Environment (IHE).**

The Panel references [Amendment 21](#) to the Government Plan, which was lodged on 28<sup>th</sup> November 2022. Due to this timing, the Panel has not had the opportunity to ask any questions to the Minister for Children and Education, or any other Minister responsible for IHE. The Amendment specifically describes the Council of Ministers' intention to use the Land Acquisition Head of Expenditure to secure sites relating to the use of Gas Place for a new primary school in St Helier<sup>188</sup>.

The intention for Gas Place to be the location of a new Town School was published in the '[Town Primary School Review](#)', which was published by the Minister for Children and Education on 20<sup>th</sup> October 2022.

The Panel is aware that the cost of removing contaminated soil from the adjacent Millennium Town Park site was in the sum of £1,184,433.27<sup>189</sup>.

The Panel would like to ensure that the logistics and cost of removing contaminated soil from the Gas Place site for the new proposed primary school is factored into the value and acquisition of the land by the Council of Ministers and the Government of Jersey.

**FINDING 29**

Amendment 21 to the Proposed Government Plan, lodged by the Council of Ministers, highlights that the 'Land Acquisition' Head of Expenditure will be used to secure sites relating to the use of Gas Place for a new primary school.

**RECOMMENDATION 11**

The Council of Ministers should confirm the estimated costs for removing contaminated soil from the Gas Place site. This cost should be factored into the acquisition of any land required for the new town primary school.

<sup>188</sup> [Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026 \(P.97/2022\): Twenty-First Amendment](#)

<sup>189</sup> [Freedom of Information request authored by the States of Jersey and published on 12<sup>th</sup> May 2015](#)

## New School and Educational Developments

### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023-2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
3,504	10,868	11,950	16,700

### Overview

As detailed in the ‘School Estates’ section above, certain projects which were previously being developed within that major project have been moved into other Grouped Heads of Expenditure, one of which is the ‘New School and Educational Developments’. The reason given for the change in the Proposed Government Plan is:

- To enable prioritisation, subject to the appropriate business case being produced;
- To help CYPES manage project delays and the high degree of uncertainty in the construction market; and
- *‘Where projects are delayed or need to be re-evaluated due to changing economic considerations, the Grouped Head of Expenditure enables funding to be reprioritised or for other priority projects to be accelerated’.*<sup>190</sup>

### Panel Analysis

The Panel asked for further details and was advised that the following projects were being progressed within ‘New School and Educational Developments’ Head of Expenditure:

- Mont à l’Abbé Extension;
- Mont à l’Abbé Secondary School;
- Digital Centre of Excellence;
- FE Campus;
- Development of Primary Schools in St Helier;
- Replacement Rouge Bouillon;
- VCP Replacement School; and
- Le Rocquier Sports Centre.<sup>191</sup>

The Panel notes that, of the list provided above, Mont à l’Abbé Secondary School and VCP replacement school have moved from the ‘School Estates’ major project.

### Feasibility

The Panel noted that the Government Plan also contained a separate Head of Expenditure for ‘Feasibility’ (page 53 and 54) which listed various CYPES projects such as Mont à l’Abbé Secondary School, VCP Replacement School, et. al. that had been confirmed in the ‘New School and Educational Developments Head of Expenditure’. The Panel sought to understand why certain projects were listed in more than one Heads of Expenditure. The Minister for Children and Education advised that:

*Project costs relating to preparatory works prior to construction are contained in the ‘Feasibility’ section. Project costs relating to construction and building improvements*

<sup>190</sup> [‘Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026’](#), p.57

<sup>191</sup> [Letter, Minister for Children and Education, 8<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

*are contained in the two CYPES capital heads of expenditure (New school and educational development, and Upgrade to CYPES estate).<sup>192</sup>*

In a public hearing the Minister provided with some further detail about the various projects which were assigned feasibility funding:

***The Minister for Children and Education:***

*... it is the feasibility because we have not done feasibility on this. It is not something that I can sign off and progress tomorrow. The Mont a L'Abbé extension; the feasibility is done, the plan is done, the tender almost done, and I can progress. But on all these projects I need to do the same process before it is progressing. Yes, absolutely. If you are looking into the field education campus, I promise that by the end of this year, beginning of next year, I will publish the further education White Paper, and this paper would guide what will be the further education campus. I started to work with all providers for the higher education on the Island and looking into how higher education offer will look. It also will inform how the campus might look because if you have more higher education offers on the Island we would need to have the right infrastructure to provide this.<sup>193</sup>*

The Panel notes that of all the projects listed, there is not any transparency provided about prioritisation of projects which would make it difficult to track how the decisions are made to govern this process.

The Panel received a submission from charity, Every Child Our Future, which highlighted the particular need for the redevelopment of Rouge Bouillon School. They suggested that:

*It does not sit well with government pronouncements on equity that some of the most disadvantaged children have one of the poorest quality facilities. Given the changes some few years ago on the adjacent site, it is also disappointing that greater progress on a long-tabled issue has not happened. We note that in the recent publication of Ministerial Plans the Minister for Children and Education has included as a priority the review and delivery of the capital plan but we are concerned by the implication that the roadmap for the re-development of schools in St Helier is still in the production stage.<sup>194</sup>*

Suitability and quality of facilities was also referenced in the submission the Panel received from the NASUWT, the Teachers' Union, which advised the Panel that:

*24. It is vital that all pupils are able to learn and teachers are able to teach in fit-for-purpose and safe schools.*

*25. The additional funding outlined in the document is welcome. However, in addition, the Government should ensure that where asbestos exists in schools, a programme of phased removal is instigated to ensure that no child has to attend a school containing deadly asbestos.<sup>195</sup>*

<sup>192</sup> [Letter, Minister for Children and Education, 17<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

<sup>193</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Children and Education, 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

<sup>194</sup> [Written submission, Every Child Our Future](#)

<sup>195</sup> [Written submission, NASUWT](#)

The Panel notes that the replacement of several schools and the development of the school estates sits within this Head of Expenditure, however, there is no clarity about the timeline in which matters will be taken forward across this four-year Government plan period.

The written submission from Every Child Our Future also highlighted the importance of resources and space for libraries and music development within schools.<sup>196</sup> They have stated that:

*We would like to see a stated provision that any new premises and redevelopment for schools include and prioritise a dedicated space for a school library.<sup>197</sup>*

The Panel has undertaken site visits to a number of primary schools and is fully supportive of this suggestion from Every Child Our Future.



### FINDING 30

The 'New School and Educational Developments' Head of Expenditure has been created to give the Department of Children, Young People, Education and Skills flexibility over various development projects.



### RECOMMENDATION 12

The Minister for Children and Education should provide further detail and in the next Government Plan about the prioritisation of the projects in the 'New School and Educational Developments' Head of Expenditure, so that there is public transparency about any changes made by the department to priorities.



### RECOMMENDATION 13

As part of any school development or redesign project, including those within the 'New School and Educational Developments' Head of Expenditure, the Minister for Children and Education should commit to providing specific space for school libraries and spaces for music teaching.

## Upgrades to CYPES Estates

### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023 - 2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
13,621	8,750	8,950	8,405

### Overview

As detailed in the 'School Estates' section above, certain projects which were previously being developed within that major project have been moved into other Grouped Heads of Expenditure, one of which is the 'Upgrades to CYPES Estates'. The reason given for the change in the Proposed Government Plan is:

- To enable prioritisation, subject to the appropriate business case being produced;

<sup>196</sup> [Written submission, Every Child Our Future](#)

<sup>197</sup> [Ibid](#)

- To help CYPES manage project delays and the high degree of uncertainty in the construction market; and
- *'Where projects are delayed or need to be re-evaluated due to changing economic considerations, the Grouped Head of Expenditure enables funding to be reprioritised or for other priority projects to be accelerated'.<sup>198</sup>*

### Panel Analysis

The Panel noted that page 58 of the Proposed Government Plan provided a list of projects being developed under the new Head of Expenditure, 'Upgrades to CYPES Estates'. Of that list the work under 'Redesign of Greenfields', now to be called 'Residential Homes and Secure Settings', has moved from the 'School Estates' major project.

More detail was requested on each of the projects. The Minister's responses have been copied into the right-hand column of the table below:

Project	<b>Update / detail provided by the Minister for Children and Education<sup>199</sup></b>
<b>School improvements</b>	<p><i>Not only is it important to address both inadequate indoor and outdoor facilities, we must also ensure investment in buildings improvements relating to temperature and air quality, fire risk and site health and safety.</i></p> <p><i>I will shortly be undertaking a prioritisation review of the CYPES estate and following this will task Officers to formulate a programme of works for 2023 and beyond.</i></p>
<b>Residential Homes and Secure Settings</b>	<p><i>The work to be undertaken for the 'Redesign of Greenfields' has been renamed to 'Residential Homes &amp; Secure Settings' and will include improvements works required at Greenfields and residential homes. Further investment may be needed for the significant redevelopment of Greenfields once the full scope has been established, and therefore, a subsequent Government Plan bid may be requested.</i></p>
<b>Therapeutic Children's Homes</b>	<p><i>It is vitally important that there is a sufficient number, range and quality of placements for looked after children. This will require the development of a new specialist therapeutic home and the realignment of an existing home into close support residential home. Officers are exploring opportunities for the purchase of a new home, and I will update the Panel on progress in the future.</i></p>
<b>Music Development</b>	<p><i>Within the 2022 Government Plan funding was available for the redevelopment of the Jersey Music Service (JMS) and the introduction of a new music facility at Jersey College for Girls.</i></p> <p><i>Finding a suitable site for a new JMS has been problematic with no location yet to be confirmed. With regard to the Jersey College for Girls Music Centre, the original budget allocated for</i></p>

<sup>198</sup> ['Proposed Government Plan 2023-2026'](#), p.57

<sup>199</sup> [Letter, Minister for Children and Education, 8<sup>th</sup> November 2022](#)

	<i>this project is no longer sufficient due to increased costs. I have therefore taken the decision to undertake a review of music tuition provision and facilities across the island before proceeding further. I will be forming a working group to carry out further analysis before making any decision of capital priorities for music provision.</i>
<b>Field Developments and Play Space</b>	<i>I have instructed Officers to proceed with work on the development of a playing field for St John's School, with work underway with the School and Parish. I am also seeking to develop First Tower Field H1533 for the benefit of both the school and local community. Pre-feasibility work is underway, and Officers from Jersey Property Holdings are in discussions with the owner of the field about progressing this project.</i>
<b>Youth Services</b>	<p><i>I am committed to finding a solution to the North of Town Youth and Community Centre (now renamed Central St Helier Youth and Community Centre). As the Panel will be aware, finding a suitable site in St Helier has been problematic, however I will continue working with the Constable and local Deputies to find a solution.</i></p> <p><i>I have instructed Officers to continue feasibility work on updating youth and community facilities at Le Squez and expect progress on this project in 2023. I will also be proceeding with improvements to the facilities at St Aubin's Fort, which will result in improved accommodation and access for groups.</i></p>

In a written submission to the Panel from the NASUWT, The Teachers Union stated that:

*26. The NASUWT also welcomes the investment in additional and new facilities in the wider CYPES remit.*

The Panel notes that of all the projects listed, there is not any transparency provided about prioritisation of projects which would make it difficult to track how the decisions are made to govern this process. As previously noted, the Panel has made a recommendation (number 10) that 'The Minister for Children and Education should ensure that future Government Plans provide transparent breakdowns of planned estates projects within Grouped Heads of Expenditure'.



#### **FINDING 31**

The 'Upgrades to CYPES Estates' Head of Expenditure has been created to give the Department of Children, Young People, Education and Skills flexibility over various development projects.



#### **RECOMMENDATION 14**

The Minister for Children and Education should provide further detail in the next Government Plan about the prioritisation of the projects in the 'Upgrades to CYPES Estates' Head of Expenditure, so that there is public transparency about any changes made by the department to priorities.

## Army and Sea Cadet Headquarters

### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023 - 2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
960	2,283	-	-

The Panel noted that the Sea Cadets had previously had a long-term base at Fort Regent, before being moved to a temporary site at Rouge Bouillon adjacent to the SoJFRS. The Panel asked the Minister for Home Affairs for an update on the project, which had a total budget approval of £3.393 million (from previous Government Plans):

#### ***The Minister for Home Affairs:***

*... The Army and Sea Cadet Headquarters project has progressed through initial planning and design stages through 2022. We have had some very constructive discussions with cadet leaders about the specifications for the building and a potential location has been identified. It is intended that very early in 2023 the location can be confirmed and made public and that further design and feasibility work can be undertaken to progress to a planning application.<sup>200</sup>*

The Minister advised that the site could not be confirmed during the hearing on 11<sup>th</sup> November 2022 due to commercial sensitivity.<sup>201</sup>

In a written submission to the Panel (full document available [here](#)) the Sea Cadets highlighted the civic drive of the organisation, including the promotion of various community service occupations. With regards to their requirements, it was advised that:

1. “Do we need a brand-new purpose-built unit” – **not necessarily this is a nice to have.**
2. “Do we need a permanent home / facility that is fit for purpose that will not fall down around us in the next 10yrs” – **Absolutely / Definitely**

The Panel has not received any information about the new location or feasibility work undertaken on the identified site, therefore, whilst the Panel is content with the rationale for the project in principle, no comment can be made on the suitability of the funding allocation.

#### **FINDING 32**



A potential location for the future Army and Sea Cadet headquarters has been identified and the project has been progressed with initial planning and design, involving consultation from cadet leaders. The location of the new Army and Sea Cadet Headquarters will be announced in early 2023.



#### **RECOMMENDATION 15**

The Minister for Home Affairs should announce the site and publish the plans for the new Army and Sea Cadet Headquarters as soon as possible in 2023. With a view to long term recruitment, the Minister for Home Affairs and the Minister for

<sup>200</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Home Affairs, 11<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p.2](#)

<sup>201</sup> [Ibid](#)

Children and Education should explore ties with the cadet services to ensure that there are sufficient opportunities to connect cadets with the range of community service occupations and career opportunities.

## Firearms Range

### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023 - 2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
1,775	-	-	-

The Panel notes that the plans for a new firearms range for use by the States of Jersey Police have been in several previous Government Plans, the total approved cost of the project being £2.239 million.

In a public hearing the Panel asked for an update and was advised that:

#### **Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:**

*... The firearms range has been long in the making since before my arrival 3 years ago. What we currently have is vitally important, indeed the only way we can ensure proper certification of shooting what is probably best described as long-barrelled weapons. We send armed officers off-Island to various locations in the U.K. (United Kingdom) on already busy places at quite significant cost, something in the region of around £60,000 or £70,000 a year. That means that those officers are off the Island, so non-deployable, and of course that also means that they are away from their families for periods of time. That does not make a great deal of sense and I know my colleagues have worked very hard, both before I arrived and since, to find a suitable location. That planning permission has been granted, as you may have seen in some of the notes, which I am delighted about.<sup>202</sup>*

The Panel also learned that there were certain risks to the delivery of the project because of the economic climate and current building costs and risks, however, it was hoped that progress would be made in the first half of 2023. The Chief Officer explained that:

*The current challenge we have, I guess, as with all capital projects, is getting enough suitable bidders and those bidders having the confidence to bid against the costs, given the current issues within the world about costing things properly. So we currently only have one bidder for one reason or another. We are trying to encourage others and we are currently in negotiation to do as you often hear, start putting spades in the ground and start building this thing. My hope and expectation is we will be able to do that in the first half of next year.<sup>203</sup>*

The Panel noted that there was a long tradition of firearms facilities in the Island and queried whether the Police could have collaborated to user adapt existing facilities. The Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police advised that this was not possible with the specifications that the Police required for their training, however, he confirmed that the new facility could be 'for the Island', not exclusively Police Officers.<sup>204</sup>

<sup>202</sup> [Ibid, p.5](#)

<sup>203</sup> [Ibid](#)

<sup>204</sup> [Ibid, p.6](#)

### Criminal Offences Confiscation Fund

The Panel was advised that the development of the Police Firearms Range would come exclusively from the Criminal Offences Confiscation Fund (COCF), which is a fund established under Article 24 of the Proceeds of Crime (Jersey) Law 1999 and is considered to be a 'special fund' for the purposes of the Public Finances (Jersey) Law 2005.<sup>205</sup>

**Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:**

*The funding for that comes exclusively from the Criminal Offences Confiscation Fund, which seems to me a really good place to use that money. It will mean that we will be able to train our officers and indeed I suspect that the facility will be so good it will attract other people, so therefore it could attract an income. There is, of course, a recognition that shooting firearms in the Island has deep traditions and we are keen to be good neighbours with those that are also shooting in that area. I am confident that either we have achieved that or we are achieving that.<sup>206</sup>*

The Panel noted that the amount to be transferred from the COCF to the Consolidated Fund in 2023 was £1.8 million, which was lower than the total funding required for the various projects which are named as being funded by the COCF. The Panel therefore further questioned the source of funds:

**Deputy C.D. Curtis:**

*Page 58 of the proposed Government Plan states that both the firearms range and Dewberry House projects are funded out of the Criminal Offences Confiscation Fund, as mentioned. However, the panel notes on page 74 that the amount being transferred from the Criminal Offences Confiscation Fund to the consolidated fund is £1.8 million in 2023, which is less than those 2 projects require. Please could you confirm is there enough source of funding for them?*

**The Minister for Home Affairs:**

*I think it is my understanding that what is being drawn is what is required, so although the projects are going to be costing more, because of the difficulties and delays that Robin has articulated, the money will only be drawn down as it is required.*

**Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:**

*It is my understanding that all the costs will be met. There has been, as I understand it, inflationary costs, as you would expect, but I do not think there is any suggestion there will be not enough to cover off those costs. That is my understanding.*

**Deputy C.D. Curtis:**

*So the expectation is that it will all come from the Criminal Offences Confiscation Fund?*

**The Minister for Home Affairs:**

---

<sup>205</sup> [Proceeds of Crime \(Jersey\) Law 1999 \(jerseylaw.je\)](http://jerseylaw.je)

<sup>206</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Home Affairs, 11<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p.5](#)

*Yes, eventually it will all come from the Criminal Offences Confiscation Fund.<sup>207</sup>*

Based on the information provided, the Panel is content with the rationale for this programme, however, has queries about the cashflow funding allocation from the Criminal Offences Confiscation Fund.



### FINDING 33

The new Firearms Range has received planning permission, however, at the time of the Panel's hearing only one bid had been received for the building and delivery of the project. In addition to providing the Police with a site to train and use long arm weapons, the new facility could be used by other Islanders.



### FINDING 34

The Firearms Range will be solely funded out of the Criminal Offences Confiscation Fund.



### RECOMMENDATION 16

The Minister for Home Affairs should clarify the cashflow from the Criminal Offences Confiscation Fund (£1.8 million) in 2023. This relates to the 2023 funding for the Firearms Range (£1.7 million), Dewberry House (£2.8 million) and the Prison Improvement works (£2.985 million).



### RECOMMENDATION 17

The Minister for Home Affairs should ensure that Islanders and community groups, where appropriate, can use the new Firearms Range facility.

## Dewberry House – Sexual Assault Referral Centre

### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023 - 2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
2,851	1,004	-	-

Dewberry House is a sexual assault referral centre in Jersey for people who have been raped or sexually assaulted. The Panel noted that the total project approval for Dewberry House was £4.291 million, as per previous Government Plans.

The Panel asked for some further details about this estates project:

#### **Chief Officer, States of Jersey Police:**

*... For those poor people who have been the victim of a sexual assault, I think the facility is excellent, but we now have greater plans, hence the budget that has been assigned to it. My understanding is that we have the planning permission for that. We are still looking at how we can work out what is the best part of the building, how the building will work. We had a conversation earlier on last week at I think it is Heathfield.*

[...]

<sup>207</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Home Affairs, 11<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p.7](#)

*Again, I do not get a sense that the timescales are going to stretch but it would not surprise me if they do because of the same challenges that we have elsewhere. I think this will be a world class facility, I genuinely do, and in the very best interests of those poor victims of crime.<sup>208</sup>*

The Panel was also interested to learn about the Government of Jersey's relationship with the charity Jersey Action Against Rape (JAAR), who provide a Helpline and Counselling service for anyone in Jersey aged 18 and over, of any gender and is a survivor themselves, a family member or, friend of a survivor who has experienced sexual assault or rape<sup>209</sup>. The Minister advised the Panel that:

*The previous SLA with JAAR expired several years ago and officers are in regular discussion with a view to agreeing a new arrangement. This is not yet finalised.<sup>210</sup>*

The Panel asked JAAR to comment on the proposed funding allocated to Dewberry House. They advised that they were unable to comment due to the lack of publicly accessible documentation that provides details about the funding or how it will improve services or continue business as usual, however, they also highlighted that:

*Our comments would merely be that the Sexual Assault Referral Centre is of great importance to the community of Jersey with the support of the Independent Sexual Violence Advocates and the Forensic teams<sup>211</sup>.*

The Panel is supportive of the principle of the project but, as per Recommendation 16, queries the cashflow from the Criminal Offences Confiscation Fund for 2023 funding.



### FINDING 35

Clarification is required about the funding of the Dewberry House – Sexual Assault Referral Centre Estates project from the Criminal Offences Confiscation Fund for 2023.

## Prison Improvement Works

### Funding allocation requests in Government Plan 2023 - 2026 (£000):

2023	2024	2025	2026
2,985	-	-	-

The Minister for Home Affairs updated the Panel on the Prison Improvement works in a public hearing on 11<sup>th</sup> November 2022 (full transcript available [here](#)) and the information is summarised below:

<sup>208</sup> [Ibid, p.6](#)

<sup>209</sup> [Written submission, Jersey Action Against Rape](#)

<sup>210</sup> [Letter, Minister for Home Affairs, 22<sup>nd</sup> November 2022](#)

<sup>211</sup> [Submission – Jersey Action Against Rape](#)

<b>Prison Improvement Phases<sup>212</sup></b>	
Phase 6	Will include a new gatehouse, offices, conference room, hot desking facility for Government of Jersey staff, possible community use (for example parish 'surgeries').  Due to complete in weeks following 11th November 2022.
Phase 6B	Includes the demolition of A, B and C wings.  Demolition will be done sequentially, as tenders received for demolition of all at once was over budget.
Phase 7	Has been pushed back to 2027 due to affordability and delivery reasons.  Includes certain works to ensure fire safety compliance.
Phase 8	Includes landscaping works. CCTV upgrades (likely to request funding for this work in 2024 and will be done in coordination with other Government departments).  Pre-release / outworkers unit – possibly a café and a hospitality training facility. To support the ethos of 'releasing better neighbours'.

The Panel had undertaken a site visit to the prison on 19<sup>th</sup> October 2022. The Panel noted that some of the Prison Improvement works were to be funded out of the Criminal Offences Confiscation Fund (COCF). The Government Plan explains that a separate Grouped Head of Expenditure is proposed for the Prison Improvement works that are funded from the COCF (see Table 25, p. 58 of the [Government Plan 2023-2026](#)).

As previously recorded the 'Firearms Range' and 'Dewberry House' sections above, the Panel notes that the Government Plan proposes £1.811 million of capital financing transfers in from the COCF to the Consolidated Fund in 2023, which does not appear to align with the required funding for projects from this funding source.

The Panel was also interested to find out whether solar panels would be incorporated into the Prison Improvement works:

**Deputy B. Porée:**

*If I just may ask with regards to this immense body of work that is due to take place, are there any plans to introduce solar panels in the prison, say using the roof space?*

**The Minister for Home Affairs:**

*That is a very good question that I do not know the answer to.*

**Director General, Justice and Home Affairs:**

*We have talked about it for future developments but they are not incorporated in the gatehouse, which is about to complete.*

**The Connétable of Grouville:**

<sup>212</sup> [Summarised from transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Home Affairs, 11<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p.3](#)

*When we went on our visit there were acres and acres of lovely south-facing roof space and I was a bit dismayed that there was not anything up.*

***The Minister for Home Affairs:***

*Let me take that back to the project team and I know it is certainly something that the Minister for the Environment and my Assistant Minister for Climate and Energy would be very interested in.<sup>213</sup>*

The Panel is supportive of the principle of the project but, as per Recommendation 16 queries the cashflow from the Criminal offences Confiscation Fund for 2023 funding.

**FINDING 36**



Prison Improvement is underway at H.M. Prison La Moye in various phases. Works will continue beyond 2023 and further funding will be required. Plans include using parts of the prison estate as a space for the wider community and workplace 'hub' for Government employees.

**FINDING 37**



Clarification is required about the funding of the Prison Improvement Works from the Criminal Offences Confiscation Fund for 2023.



**RECOMMENDATION 18**

The Minister for Home Affairs should explore opportunities for adding solar panels to H.M. Prison La Moye as part of future improvement works at the site.

<sup>213</sup> [Transcript, Public Hearing with the Minister for Home Affairs, 11<sup>th</sup> November 2022, p.4](#)

## 10 Witnesses and Evidence Gathered

---

Public hearings were held with the following Ministers:

- Minister for Children and Education on Wednesday 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022; and
- Minister for Home Affairs on Friday 11<sup>th</sup> November 2022.

Responses to written questions were received from the following Ministers:

- Minister for Children and Education – Letter dated 8<sup>th</sup> November 2022;
- Minister for Children and Education – Letter dated 17<sup>th</sup> November 2022;
- Minister for Home Affairs – Letter dated 9<sup>th</sup> November 2022; and
- Minister for Home Affairs – Letter dated 22<sup>nd</sup> November 2022.

Requests for written submissions were sent to 19 stakeholders and responses were received from the following:

- Autism Jersey;
- Every Child Our Future;
- Jersey Music Service;
- NASUWT, The Teachers Union;
- NSPCC, Jersey;
- Jersey Fire and Rescue Service Association;
- Jersey Action Against Rape;
- Jersey Police Authority;
- Jersey Probation and After-Care Service; and
- Sea Cadets.

To view all the submissions, responses to written questions and public hearing transcripts, please visit the [review page](#) on the States Assembly website.

## Appendix 1

### Terms of Reference

#### **Government Plan 2023 - 2026 Terms of Reference**

1. To review components of the Government Plan 2023-2026 Proposition which are relevant to the Children, Education and Home Affairs Scrutiny Panel to determine the following:
  - a) The impact of the Government Plan proposals on departmental budgets, savings and staffing levels.
  - b) Whether the proposed additional revenue programmes and capital projects are appropriate and likely to have a positive impact on Islanders and Island life.
  - c) How additional revenue programmes and capital projects align with the Common Strategic Policy and the aims and objectives of the Ministerial Plans.
  - d) If the resources allocated to projects are sufficient, ensure value for money and are best use of public funds.

### Panel membership

The Panel comprised of the following States Members:



**Deputy Catherine Curtis  
Chair of the Panel**



**Deputy Beatriz Porée  
Vice-Chair of the Panel**



**Connétable Mark Labey  
Member of the Panel**

## Appendix 2

### Overarching recommendations, as per S.R. 20/2022 presented by the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel on 7<sup>th</sup> December 2022

**RECOMMENDATION 1 (OVERARCHING):** The components encapsulated within the Government Programme should have an evident link running through them and this should be clearly referenced within future Government Plans. Future Government Plans must include clear reference to how the Common Strategic Policy, Ministerial Plans, Delivery Plans, heads of expenditure and the Jersey Performance Framework link as part of the Government Programme.

**RECOMMENDATION 3 (OVERARCHING):** The Government Plan Annex must be produced and published in tandem with the Government Plan for future iterations of the Plan. Given the shortened lodging period for a Government Plan within an election year, consideration should be given to future election years with regard to how the Annex can be provided in tandem with the Government Plan and without placing undue difficulty on officials.

**RECOMMENDATION 4 (OVERARCHING):** The Government must ensure for all future Government Plans that priority is given to the work of Scrutiny and due regard to ensuring Scrutiny receives any requested information to inform its work within the allocated timeframe provided and in accordance with the proceedings outlined within the Code of Practice for Engagement between Scrutiny Panels and the Public Accounts Committee and the Executive.

**RECOMMENDATION 5 (OVERARCHING):** Future Government Plans must provide detailed Ministerial mapping for departmental budgets which includes a detailed breakdown of how funding is split between programmes and services when lodged. This mapping must be apparent in the Ministerial Plans so that it is clear as to how the workstreams and policy initiatives laid out in the Ministerial Plans align and appear in the Government Plan as funding proposals.

**RECOMMENDATION 6 (OVERARCHING):** A mid-year review update report must be published in future years prior to the lodging of the Government Plan by the deadline of 31<sup>st</sup> August each year. The report must include progress updates on all projects and programmes, detail on how the funding has been allocated to date, whether the delivery is on track and to be delivered by the identified timescale and within the budget allocated.

**RECOMMENDATION 8 (OVERARCHING):** To enhance transparency and accountability of the Government Plan process, the Council of Ministers must include detail in relation to ongoing expenditure and business as usual projects within future Government Plans.

**RECOMMENDATION 10 (OVERARCHING):** The Council of Ministers should consider how future Government Plans can be made more accessible to children and young people. Consideration should be given to creating a young-person friendly two-page summary document and the provision of workshops in respect of the Government Plan process. This work should be completed in time for inclusion in next year's Government Plan.

**RECOMMENDATION 11 (OVERARCHING):** The Council of Ministers should consider how the accessibility of future Government Plans can be further enhanced for members of the public. Consideration should be given to the use of digital summary reports to accompany future Government Plans and where possible avoiding the use of proposition numbers within public facing documents.

**RECOMMENDATION 17 (OVERARCHING):** The Council of Ministers must include within future Government Plans recognition of the trade-offs involved, either explicitly or implicitly

made through the political decision process when prioritising funding allocations to new revenue expenditure growth investments.

**RECOMMENDATION 18 (OVERARCHING):** In line with the recommendations of the Fiscal Policy Panel, the Government Plan should only include Value for Money savings where there is clear evidence of how they will be achieved.

**RECOMMENDATION 19 (OVERARCHING):** The Council of Ministers should undertake reporting on the impact to public services resultant of value for money savings made, with the reports being published with each Government Plan.

**RECOMMENDATION 20 (OVERARCHING):** The Council of Ministers must ensure the monitoring process for the Value for Money Programme is included in future Government Plans to provide further transparency and accountability.

**RECOMMENDATION 21 (OVERARCHING):** The Council of Ministers must ensure that business cases for New Revenue Growth Programme bids are provided to Scrutiny Panels prior to lodging each Government Plan.



States Greffe | Morier House | Halkett Place | St Helier | Jersey | JE1 1DD  
T: +44 (0) 1534 441 020 | E: [statesgreffe@gov.je](mailto:statesgreffe@gov.je) | W: [Statesassembly.gov.je](http://Statesassembly.gov.je)

